

MEMORANDUM

To: Carley Murray and Patricia Gonzales, NYSERDA

From: Jane Peters, Dulane Moran, and Hale Forster, Research Into Action

Date: 10 April 2013

Re: FINAL Work Plan for GJGNY CBO Process Evaluation and Market Characterization/Assessment

SECTION 1:

NOTICE

This report was prepared by Research Into Action, Inc., in the course of performing work contracted for and sponsored by the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (hereinafter the “Sponsor”). The opinions expressed in this report do not necessarily reflect those of the Sponsors or the State of New York, and reference to any specific product, service, process, or method does not constitute an implied or expressed recommendation or endorsement of it. Further, the Sponsors, the State of New York, and the contractor make no warranties or representations, expressed or implied, as to the fitness for particular purpose or merchantability of any product, apparatus, or service, or the usefulness, completeness, or accuracy of any processes, methods, or other information contained, described, disclosed, or referred to in this report. The Sponsor, the State of New York, and the contractor make no representation that the use of any product, apparatus, process, method, or other information will not infringe privately owned rights and will assume no liability for any loss, injury, or damage resulting from, or occurring in connection with, the use of information constrained, described, disclosed, or referred to in this report.

SECTION 2:

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Memorandum.....	1
SECTION 1: NOTICE	I
SECTION 2: TABLE OF CONTENTS	II
List of Tables	ii
SECTION 3: INTRODUCTION	3-1
SECTION 4: PROGRAM DESCRIPTION	4-1
4.1 CBO Selection and Approach	4-1
4.2 CBO Regions and Goals	4-2
4.3 Outreach Tactics.....	4-5
SECTION 5: EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	1
5.1 Evaluation Components	1
5.1.1 Interim Report.....	1
5.1.2 Final Report	1
5.2 Research Objectives	1
5.2.1 Process Evaluation	1
5.2.2 Market Characterization Assessment.....	2
5.3 Interim Report Tasks.....	2
5.3.1 Task 1: Project Kickoff and Work Plan Development.....	2
5.3.2 Task 2: Sampling Plan	3
5.3.3 Task 3: Instrument Development.....	3
5.3.4 Task 4: Data Collection	3
5.3.5 Task 5: Data Analysis and Report Preparation	3
5.3.6 Task 6: Presentation of Preliminary Results	4
5.3.7 Timelines, Deliverables and Staffing	4
5.4 Final Report Tasks	5
5.4.1 Task 1: Develop Final Report Work Plan	5
5.4.2 Task 2: Sampling Plan	5
5.4.3 Task 3: Instrument Development.....	6
5.4.4 Task 4: Data Collection	6
5.4.5 Task 5: Data Analysis and Report Preparation	6
5.4.6 Timelines, Deliverables, and Staffing.....	6
List of Tables	
Table 3-1. Activities for Process Evaluation of GJGNY CBO Program	3-3
Table 4-1: CBO Regions and CBOs Affiliated with Each	4-2
Table 4-2: Preliminary Review of CBO Goals	4-3
Table 5-1. GJGNY CBO Sampling Plan: Interim Deliverable	3
Table 5-2. Anticipated Schedule of Milestones and Deliverables	4
Table 5-3. Project Staff.....	5
Table 5-4. Timeframe	5
Table 5-5. GJGNY CBO Sampling Plan: Final Report Data Collection	6
Table 5-6. Anticipated Schedule of Milestones and Deliverables	7
Table 5-7. Project Staff.....	7
Table 5-8. Timeframe	7

SECTION 3:

INTRODUCTION

On October 9, 2009, the Green Jobs Green New York Act of 2009 was signed into law. The Act directs NYSERDA to establish and administer the Green Jobs-Green New York (GJGNY) Program. NYSERDA was directed to implement the program in consultation with the Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR), Department of Labor (DOL), Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance (OTDA), Department of Public Service (DPS), Power Authority of the State of New York (NYPA), Department of Economic Development (DED), and the Department of Environmental Conservation (DEC). The program is funded with \$112 million from the proceeds of selling CO2 allowances under the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI).

The GJGNY Program is a statewide program to promote energy efficiency and the installation of clean technologies to reduce energy costs and greenhouse gas emissions. The program provides access to no-cost and reduced-cost energy audits, installation services, low-cost, innovative financing through revolving loan funds, workforce development, job placement, and outreach by constituency-based organizations serving targeted communities. GJGNY Program components have been integrated into the following NYSERDA efforts: Workforce Development, Home Performance with Energy Star (HPwES), Multifamily Performance Program, Small Commercial/Non-for-Profit Program, and Outreach and Marketing through Constituency-based Organizations (CBOs).

This work plan presents the evaluation activities planned for the CBO Outreach and Marketing efforts. CBO activities are just one component of the GJGNY Program; however they touch upon all of the other components (Workforce Development, HPwES, Multifamily Performance Program, and Small Commercial/Non-for-Profit Program). While the scopes of work that guide each CBO are different, as a group the CBOs work to connect community members to GJGNY Program services including those that support workforce development training as well as audits and financing in order to spur energy upgrades. In addition to the specific activities of the CBOs, this process evaluation will document the experience of the CBO organizations during project ramp up including preparing their proposals and negotiating their scopes of work, the value of training and tools provided, and the outreach support services they have received.

Although CBO goals include residential, small commercial, and multifamily efficiency, as well as workforce development goals, most CBO resources are allocated to residential efficiency outreach, particularly through the HPwES Program. Consistent with this focus, the evaluation will look primarily at CBO residential efficiency activities, although interviews will include questions about all of the elements included in the CBO contracts.

This evaluation includes two deliverables: an Interim Report focused on the results of in-depth interviews with representatives from each CBO and key program contacts to be completed by June 2013; and a Final Report that builds on the results of interim findings and includes surveys with audit recipients and those with completed HPwES retrofits as well as contractors affiliated with CBO initiative efforts, to be completed by January 2014.

Table 3-1 summarizes the activities, methodology, and key objectives of this evaluation.

Table 3-1. Activities for Process Evaluation and Market Characterization/Assessment of GJGNY CBO Program

Evaluation Activity	Methodology	Objective
Interim Report		
NYSERDA, Training and Implementation Contractor Staff Interviews	Conduct in-depth interviews with NYSERDA program staff and Training and Implementation Contractor staff.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Understand the experiences and lessons learned in working with CBOs ▪ Review previous and current internal research ▪ Document planned program revisions
CBO Key Contacts In-Depth Interviews	Conduct in-depth interviews with key contacts at each CBO.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Understand CBO experiences and lessons learned in project launch and in programmatic activities ▪ Document community composition ▪ Document planned and underway activities promoting energy efficiency and workforce development ▪ Review tracking systems
In-depth documentation	Case study summaries of at least four CBOs – two that appear to be successfully meeting their goals, and two that have struggled or revamped their approach.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provide deeper understanding of components of success and barriers experienced by CBOs ▪ Explore the importance of organizational characteristics and community characteristics
Final Report		
Audit recipient surveys	Survey with those that received a discounted audit through CBO activities*	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Understand the influence of the CBO on targeted community members ▪ Document barriers to completing a HPwES-qualified upgrade ▪ Identify the motivations and expectations behind receiving the audit
Completed retrofit participant surveys	Survey with households that completed a HPwES qualified retrofit and were influenced by CBO activities*	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Understand the influence of the CBO on targeted community members ▪ Identify the motivations and expectations behind completing the project ▪ Document any process issues specific to CBO activities
Trade ally survey	Survey with retrofit contractors affiliated with CBO activities*	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Identify level of interaction with CBOs and any value obtained from CBO interaction
Document CBO accomplishments	Follow-up in-depth interviews with representatives from each CBO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Document final accomplishments and lessons learned by each CBO ▪ Document plans for program continuation or sustainability, as appropriate.

*To be conducted as part of the HPwES evaluation planned for 2013.

SECTION 4:

PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

GJGNY is a statewide program that promotes energy efficiency, reduces energy consumption and greenhouse gas emissions, supports sustainable community development, and creates job opportunities. One component of the GJGNY Program delivers services in targeted communities with the support of Constituency Based Organizations (CBOs). CBOs are expected to conduct outreach, marketing, and education through a coordinated approach that targets priority communities. As defined in the statute, customer outreach by CBOs is targeted to economically distressed communities, non-attainment areas under the federal Clean Air Act, and communities with high energy costs in relation to income.

Through RFPs 2038 and 2327 NYSEDA selected 18 CBOs to provide a variety of services to encourage comprehensive energy upgrades in single family homes, multifamily buildings, and among small commercial or nonprofit organizations. CBOs are expected to leverage their particular connections and capacity to reach homeowners and building owners through direct, innovative outreach activities. Upgrade projects are expected to tap into existing NYSEDA program opportunities and on the residential side, work with Building Performance Institute (BPI)-accredited companies to complete projects financed through the GJGNY Loan Fund. The CBO component of the GJGNY Program is aligned with NYSEDA's existing residential programs including Home Performance with ENERGY STAR® (HPwES) and its low income component, Assisted Home Performance with ENERGY STAR (AHPwES). However, GJGNY-supported CBO activities also support small commercial and multifamily efficiency efforts, particularly in urban areas. In addition to the activities designed to inform homeowners and encourage qualified retrofit projects, many CBOs are partnering with contractors, workforce development organizations or organized trade groups to facilitate awareness of and enrollment in the GJGNY training services program.

As part of their activities encouraging residential retrofits, some CBOs also proposed aggregation pilot initiatives. In these aggregation pilots, CBOs recruit a collection of eligible homes who have agreed to use the same contractor or contractor team to perform audits and retrofit work. Aggregation is intended to benefit both homeowners and contractors by simplifying the participation process and lowering costs.

The GJGNY Program seeks to increase penetration of energy efficiency retrofits and financing by targeting previously untapped customers in the priority regions listed in Table 4-1.

Overall objectives of the GJGNY CBO effort are to:

- Build awareness of the GJGNY Program
- Implement research to identify opportunity segments, drivers of and barriers to energy efficiency, and effective messaging
- Build and grow participation in the GJGNY Program by increasing the:
 - Number of target neighborhoods/communities reached
 - Number of audit leads
 - Number of audits conducted
 - Audit conversion to retrofit projects financed and implemented
- Grow the number of BPI-accredited contractors
- Build the pipeline of New Yorkers participating in Green Jobs training

4.1 CBO SELECTION AND APPROACH

To select CBOs, NYSEDA issued three separate Requests for Proposals (RFP) soliciting proposals for CBOs and the Training and Implementation Contractor (TIC) responsible for overseeing them.

- **RFP 2080 (closed October 2010).** Selected a TIC responsible for providing: structured training for the CBO organizations; geographic coordination and support of CBO Outreach programs;

effective communication across all regions; tracking CBO goals including recruiting efforts; assessment and fulfillment of CBO needs; assistance in planning and coordinating events, if necessary; tracking progress of referrals made to the GJGNY programs; data gathering; assistance in evaluating aggregation pilots; and regular reporting of program activities and results to NYSERDA.

- **RFP 2038 (closed January 2011).** Selected CBOs to implement outreach and training activities in targeted regions. In most cases, CBOs are targeting disadvantaged or otherwise hard-to-reach populations. Developing scopes of work and contract documents took several months and most CBOs did not launch until 2012.
- **RFP 2327 (closed July 2011).** Released after RFP 2038, this RFP augmented the landscape of CBOs selected through RFP 2038, to fill gaps in services or regions that were underrepresented in the first set of proposals.

Both CBO recruitment RFPs included a performance-based compensation component that withheld 25% of the total contract amount for distribution as performance milestones are met. According to the RFPs, the primary goal of the customer outreach program is to increase the number of individuals or businesses making efficiency improvements and to increase training and enrollment in workforce training programs. The CBOs are compensated for meeting these goals.

The compensation structure is as follows:

- 10% upon execution of contract for staffing and ramp up;
- Up to 65% paid on a monthly basis, based on invoices submitted that document actual costs, over the term of the contract; and
- 25% pay for performance.

Each CBO proposed a goal and plan for the number of energy services retrofits the organization expected to generate over the course of the contract for outreach, or a goal for achieving enrollment in the training services program. The 25% performance payment will be distributed, depending on the component being bid on, in 25% installments upon completions of portions of each goal plan. The CBOs developed these payment milestones and in many cases, the schedule is embedded in their individual scopes of work.

4.2 CBO REGIONS AND GOALS

NYSERDA ultimately contracted a total of 18 CBOs in 12 regions. Table 4-1 lists the GJGNY-defined regions, the CBOs selected for that region, and counties covered.

Table 4-1: CBO Regions and CBOs Affiliated with Each

Region	CBO	Counties
North Country	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adirondack North Country Association 	Hamilton, Jefferson, Franklin, St. Lawrence, Lewis, Essex, Washington, Clinton, Warren, and Herkimer Counties
Bronx	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bronx Overall Economic Development Corporation • Northwest Bronx Community and Clergy Coalition 	Bronx County
Kings and Richmond	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bronx Overall Economic Development Corporation • El Puente 	Kings and Richmond Counties
Queens	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asian Americans for Equality • Neighborhood Housing Services (Jamaica) 	Queens County

Region	CBO	Counties
New York	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Downtown Manhattan Community Development Corporation Neighborhood Housing Services of New York City, Inc. (Staten Island) Civic Association Serving Harlem Make the Road 	New York County
Southern Tier	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public Policy and Education Fund of New York (Binghamton) 	Schuyler, Steuben, Chenango, Broome, Otsego, Tompkins, Tioga, and Chemung Counties
Western	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> People United for Sustainable Housing, Inc. 	Chautauqua, Allegany, Cattaraugus, Niagara, and Erie Counties
Finger Lakes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pathstone 	Seneca, Yates, Orleans, Genesee, Monroe, Livingston, Wayne, Ontario and Wyoming Counties
Central	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public Policy and Education Fund of New York (Syracuse) 	Oswego, Oneida, Cortland, Cayuga, Onondaga, and Madison Counties
Mid Hudson and Westchester	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Rural Ulster Preservation Company 	Delaware, Greene, Sullivan, Ulster, Columbia, Dutchess, Orange, Rockland, Westchester, and Putnam Counties
Long Island Region	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Long Island Progressive Coalition 	Nassau and Suffolk Counties
Capital	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Affordable Housing Partnership Northeast Parent & Child Society, Inc. 	Rensselaer, Schenectady, Albany, Saratoga, Schoharie, Montgomery, and Fulton Counties

A preliminary review of the CBOs’ scopes of work indicates goals in both workforce development and energy efficiency across the residential, small business/not for profit, and multifamily sectors. Table 4-2 below details the individual CBO goals and sectors.

Table 4-2: Preliminary Review of CBO Goals

Organization	Workforce Development	Residential Efficiency	Small Business/ NFP Efficiency	Multifamily Efficiency
Public Policy and Education Fund Central Region	✓	✓	✓	
Affordable Housing Partnership		✓		
Adirondack North Country Association	✓	✓	✓	
Public Policy and Education Fund Southern Tier	✓	✓	✓	
Northeast Parent & Child	✓			
Pathstone	✓	✓	✓	
People United for Sustainable Housing	✓	✓	✓	
Bronx Overall		✓	✓	✓
Downtown Manhattan	✓			✓
Neighborhood Housing Services of	✓	✓		

Organization	Workforce Development	Residential Efficiency	Small Business/NFP Efficiency	Multifamily Efficiency
Staten Island				
Rural Ulster Preservation Company	✓	✓	✓	
Asian Americans for Equality Community Development Fund	✓	✓		
Long Island Progressive Coalition	✓	✓		
El Puente		✓	✓	✓
Civic Association Serving Harlem		✓		
Northwest Bronx Community and Clergy Coalition	✓			
Neighborhood Housing Services Jamaica		✓	✓	
Make the Road	✓	✓		✓
Total	13	15	9	4

Within each of these sectors, CBO goals and deliverables also vary in scope and level of effort. The following is a summary of the types of goals found in CBO contracts during the preliminary review of their scopes of work.

- General goals include:
 - Creating and maintaining relationships with community partners
 - Building awareness of GJGNY opportunities
 - Holding community outreach events and workshops
 - Producing and distributing marketing materials
- Workforce goals include:
 - Raising awareness of training opportunities
 - Training screening for clean-energy workforce development programs
 - Training referrals
 - Training completions
 - Job screening
 - Job placement
 - Educating contractor firms on GJGNY opportunities
 - BPI accreditation for MWBE contractors
 - Documenting jobs created by GJGNY in the region
- Energy efficiency goals include:
 - Raising awareness of the benefits of energy efficiency
 - Generating referrals, audits, and retrofits for residential, multifamily, and/or small commercial units

Each goal typically includes a target number of individuals or organizations (such as 40 home retrofits, or 15 job seekers referred). Within CBO efficiency goals, the target ratio of upgrades to audits varies by CBO—from one in ten to nearly one-to-one. The preliminary review of CBO contracts suggests that

performance payments are generally based on achieving a subset of these goals (typically completed retrofits).

4.3 OUTREACH TACTICS

Extensive outreach, marketing, and education activities delivered by CBOs are expected to reach specific communities in new or more effective ways. These CBO outreach activities are supported by a suite of other marketing and outreach activities including GJGNY-branded collateral, website, and targeted media and public relations campaigns. NYSERDA selected a marketing contractor to provide marketing services to support the GJGNY Program. The marketing contractor is expected to provide services that help:

- Identify opportunity segments, drivers and barriers to energy efficiency, and effective messaging
- Build awareness of the GJGNY Program
- Increase participation in GJGNY Program
- Increase the number of qualified inquiries into BPI-accreditation and certification of contractors offering audit and retrofit services
- Build the pipeline of New Yorkers participating in Green Jobs training

Audits are expected to increase the level of engagement and increase interaction among targeted populations. CBO outreach programs are expected to encourage follow through with audit participants in part by promoting the attractive financing options available through the GJGNY Program.

SECTION 5:

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

This evaluation will assess the experience of NYSERDA, the CBOs, and the TIC in their efforts to implement GJGNY-funded efforts through CBOs. As mentioned above, consistent with CBO resource allocation, this evaluation will focus primarily on CBOs' residential efficiency audits and retrofit activities, but will document efforts and accomplishments in other areas as appropriate.

5.1 EVALUATION COMPONENTS

This evaluation includes two deliverables: an Interim Report documenting CBO activities and lessons learned as of spring 2013 and a Final Report that will update the CBO findings and leverage the HPwES evaluation to focus on the experiences of CBO-recruited GJGNY audit recipients and HPwES participants, as well as CBO-affiliated retrofit contractors. The Interim Report will be delivered in June 2013, the Final Report in January 2014.

5.1.1 Interim Report

The Interim Report includes two core activities. First, we will conduct in-depth interviews with representatives of each of the selected CBOs, as well as key staff at NYSERDA and the TIC. These interviews will focus on understanding their experiences, successes and lessons learned, and any planned changes in activities. Second, we will select at least four CBOs for detailed case study analysis: two that appear to be successfully meeting their goals and see additional potential and two for whom the GJGNY ramp up was a struggle and are uncertain about additional potential.

5.1.2 Final Report

The scope of the additional evaluation activities of the final report will be somewhat influenced by the interim deliverable findings. At this point, we anticipate that the final report will incorporate the interim deliverable findings with the results of additional data collection activities. These additional data collection activities will include follow-up interviews with CBOs and surveys to better understand the experiences of residential customers and contractors completing GJGNY audits and HPwES retrofits.

Participating customers and contractors will be surveyed through the HPwES process evaluation planned for later in 2013. Data collection through the HPwES evaluation will allow CBOs additional time to generate retrofit projects and will limit the survey burden on HPwES participants and contractors.

5.2 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

Based on a review of the GJGNY logic model, program documentation, and staff input, we have identified the following research objectives for the process evaluation and the market characterization assessment components of this study.

5.2.1 Process Evaluation

1. Understand the experience and lessons learned of CBOs, NYSERDA and the TIC staff
 - a. Document goals to achieve stated objectives and milestones in the CBO scopes of work
 - b. Understand how each CBO is operating within its community and how the different contexts affect delivery of efficiency and workforce development to the community
2. Categorize and develop a framework for understanding CBO characteristics and how different strategies are used by different CBOs. Identify CBO strategies that appear to be most effective at encouraging audits, energy efficiency upgrades, and (where applicable) financing uptake among all targeted customer segments.
 - a. Calculate CBO "close rates" or the extent to which outreach leads to audit and audit leads to upgrade

- b. Understand if or how CBOs are promoting financing options and facilitating the financing application process
 - c. Document the relationship between the CBOs and the qualified retrofit contractors in their area (including: how leads are distributed to auditors, if and how CBOs work with contractors to track participant process, change in availability of BPI-accredited contractors in their area.)
 - d. Investigate potential overlap with utility programs and how CBOs position HPwES relative to NYSERDA and utility program opportunities and/or GJGNY financing
 - e. Document CBO outreach efforts and enhanced services (door-to-door canvassing, events, energy advisors, web/referral services)
3. Document the experience and expectations of homeowners and contractors interacting with the CBO activities.
- a. Investigate the motivations for and barriers to completing home energy efficiency upgrades through the HPwES Program
 - b. Understand what prevented audit recipients from completing energy efficiency upgrades through the program
 - c. Identify any upgrades audit recipients undertook to reduce energy waste in their homes subsequent to receiving the audit
 - d. Understand how contractors interacted with the CBOs and document contractor views on the additional value brought by the CBOs
 - e. Investigate the extent to which CBO activities influenced homeowners and local contractors
4. For CBOs with workforce goals (primarily recruiting and training), document the key strategies involved and the workforce development activities underway.
- a. Review tracking systems and referral records
 - b. Map recruitment → training referral → training → employment process
 - c. Identify key points of engagement that seem to be particularly effective in recruitment or placement
 - d. Identify factors related to success in workforce development activities, including key training partners and services offered

5.2.2 Market Characterization Assessment

1. Document specific differences in community composition, including income, ethnicity, and other characteristics of the targeted population
2. Document the changes in availability of BPI-accredited contractors in each CBO's area, and indicators as to whether CBO efforts have increased the population of qualified retrofit contractors
3. Investigate potential overlap with utility programs and how CBOs position HPwES relative to utility program opportunities and/or GJGNY financing (also a process objective)

5.3 INTERIM REPORT TASKS

5.3.1 Task 1: Project Kickoff and Work Plan Development

The kick off meeting was held January 16, 2013, notes can be found in Appendix A. This document is the Revised Draft work plan.

5.3.2 Task 2: Sampling Plan

The focus of the interim report is on the CBO and TIC experiences with the program. With 18 CBOs included in the program, we anticipate contacting all 18 and talking to at least one staff member for every CBO that is active. We will also talk with NYSERDA, and CSG staff. Table 5-1 provides the sampling plan for the GJGNY CBO evaluation Interim Report.

Table 5-1. GJGNY CBO Sampling Plan: Interim Deliverable

Target Group	Current Population	Sample
NYSERDA Program Staff	2	2
TIC Program Staff (CSG)	2	2
CBO Key Contacts	~50	~30

5.3.3 Task 3: Instrument Development

The research team will develop data collection instruments to guide in-depth interviews. CBO interview guides will be informed by a review of program documents including the TIC annual progress report and each CBO's scope of work, as well as by information provided by program staff. These interview guides will address the research objectives, including such key issues as:

- What is the CBO's mission and position within its community?
- What are the defining elements of the community in which the CBO operates?
- What prior efficiency experience does the CBO have, if any?
- How does the CBO characterize its communication with program staff, including the TIC?
- What activities has the CBO undertaken as part of the program?
- How does the CBO promote energy efficiency opportunities in its community?
- What is the CBO's relationship with local retrofit contractors?
- Who, if anyone, has the CBO partnered with in meeting its goals?
- What systems does the CBO use to track project status and leads?
- What successes has the CBO had that are not documented in the SharePoint tracking system?
- What have been the most successful activities, from the CBO's point of view?
- What lessons has the CBO learned in working to meet its objectives?
- What changes has the CBO made, or does it plan to make, in response to those lessons learned?

One of our key tasks in the CBO and the TIC in-depth interviews will be to understand and document project tracking occurring at CBOs as well as at the TIC.

5.3.4 Task 4: Data Collection

We will conduct in-depth interviews with contacts at NYSERDA, the TICs, and each CBO. We anticipate needing to schedule interviews with multiple contacts at each CBO in order to collect information on all our research objectives. We will conduct in-person interviews with those CBOs selected for case studies, and phone interviews with NYSERDA staff, TIC staff, and the remaining CBOs.

5.3.5 Task 5: Data Analysis and Report Preparation

Because the bulk of the data collected for this interim report will be qualitative from in-depth interviews, we will use qualitative data analysis software, NVivo 10, to facilitate reliable coding and allow for comparing and contrasting qualitative findings.

We will develop summary tables of key components of CBO activities and goals, lessons learned and tactics. We will also develop CBO-specific summaries for each organization documenting their approach, organizational features, and adjustments already made or underway. Finally, we will prepare in-depth case studies of at least four CBOs—two that appear to be successfully meeting their goals and two that have struggled to meet their goals.

We will determine CBO success based on input from NYSEDA and the TICs, from self-assessment by the CBOs, and by a review of progress toward meeting goals as reported to NYSEDA by early May 2013.

5.3.6 Task 6: Presentation of Preliminary Results

Before the draft interim report is submitted, the evaluation team will prepare and present preliminary results for NYSEDA staff. This presentation will provide the opportunity for NYSEDA staff to ask questions and clarify findings. The research team will utilize the presentation and discussion to identify any issues or clarifications to be addressed prior to finalizing the report.

5.3.7 Timelines, Deliverables and Staffing

Table 5-2 displays the preliminary schedule for implementing the GJGNY CBO Evaluation.

Table 5-2. Anticipated Schedule of Milestones and Deliverables

Task	Activity, Milestone, Deliverable	Anticipated Completion Date
1	Project kick-off meeting	January 16, 2013
1	Draft Workplan	February 28, 2013
1	Final evaluation Workplan	March 22, 2013
3	Draft NYSEDA Staff and TIC interview guides	March 22, 2013
3	Final interview guides	March 29, 2013
4	In-depth Interviews	April 30, 2013
4	Case Studies	May 24, 2013
5	Presentation of Preliminary Results	June 14, 2013
6	Draft Interim Report	June 28, 2013
5	Final Interim Report	July 26, 2013

Staffing

Table 5-3 presents the estimated hours each staff category will spend on the evaluation.

Table 5-3. Project Staff

Staff Category	Estimated Hours	
President	20	Review workplan, data collection instruments, draft report documents, coordination with NYSERDA
Project Director	121	Oversight and trouble shooting, review notes and reports, strategize approach to project, writing
Senior Project Analyst	145	Combine and analyze data tracking systems, create success metrics
Project Analyst	330	Conduct in-depth interviews with CBO organizations, write up findings and conduct case studies
Research Associate	90	Collect key metrics and data points from tracking systems, SharePoint, and TIC spreadsheets
Administrative	7	Report preparation
Total	713	

Data Collection

Table 5-4 presents the timeframe for data collection to inform the Interim Report.

Table 5-4. Timeframe

Primary Data Collection Activity	Timeframe
36 in-depth interviews (CBOs, NYSERDA, the TIC, other stakeholders)	April-June 2013

5.4 FINAL REPORT TASKS

The Final Report will expand on the Interim Report by adding details and insight from surveys with participants and contractors affiliated with CBO activities. The longer timeline will also give CBOs additional time to recruit and support participants and make adjustments to their existing program activities.

5.4.1 Task 1: Develop Final Report Work Plan

Based on the results of the interim evaluation, we will make any necessary adjustments to the scope of the final evaluation. We currently anticipate coordinating with the HPwES evaluation to conduct surveys with CBO-affiliated contacts in three populations: HPwES participants, partial participants (GJGNY audit recipients), and retrofit contractors. We also anticipate completing follow-up interviews with each CBO to understand any changes made since the initial interviews as part of the interim deliverable.

5.4.2 Task 2: Sampling Plan

Table 5-5 displays currently planned survey target groups. The population of known CBO-affiliated retrofit contractors will be confirmed during the development of the interim deliverable. (The number of surveyed retrofit contractors will depend on the number of CBOs that work closely with retrofit contractors, and the number of retrofit contractors with whom each CBO works closely.)

Table 5-5. GJGNY CBO Sampling Plan: Final Report Data Collection

Target Group	Current Population	Projected Population	Sample
CBOs	18	18	18
CBO-Affiliated HPwES Participants	~275	~500	68
CBO-Affiliated GJGNY Audit Recipients	~1628	~2000	68
CBO-Affiliated Retrofit Contractors	TBD	TBD	18-36

5.4.3 Task 3: Instrument Development

Instruments for audit recipients, HPwES participants, and CBO-affiliated retrofit contractors will be developed through the HPwES process evaluation and market characterization assessment. The research team will develop survey questions for these CBO-affiliated populations as appropriate. The topics of these surveys will include:

- What are homeowners' motivations for and barriers to completing efficiency upgrades through the HPwES Program?
- How has receiving an efficiency audit influenced homeowners?
- How do homeowners and retrofit contractors characterize their experiences working with CBOs?
- How have CBOs influenced homeowners and local retrofit contractors?

Instruments for the follow-up interviews with CBOs will cover any new developments since the first interview, conducted as part of the interim report. Specifically, these instruments allow the research team to update CBO activities, goal progress, and document new lessons learned.

5.4.4 Task 4: Data Collection

Data collection for the Final Report will involve both interviews and surveys. We will conduct follow-up interviews with each of the CBOs to understand any changes they have made or experienced since our previous interview. These interviews will be particularly important for the CBOs recruited through RFP 2327, all of whom began their activities roughly six months after the initial 14 CBOs.

The surveys with HPwES participants, GJGNY audit recipients, and retrofit contractors will be conducted as part of the HPwES evaluation data collection efforts.

5.4.5 Task 5: Data Analysis and Report Preparation

The Final Report will incorporate the interim deliverable findings as well as the results of the new data collection efforts. We anticipate using a mix of quantitative and qualitative analysis tools including Excel, NVivo, and SPSS to analyze the survey and interview data collected. The follow-up CBO interviews will be used to update the findings from the interim deliverable. Although collected through the HPwES evaluation, survey data will be analyzed and reported as part of the CBO evaluation final report.

5.4.6 Timelines, Deliverables, and Staffing

Table 5-6 displays the preliminary schedule for the final GJGNY CBO Evaluation Report. We anticipate that the draft final report will be delivered in January 2014. Note that because this evaluation leverages the HPwES data collection efforts, delays in that evaluation could also delay the Final Report.

Table 5-6. Anticipated Schedule of Milestones and Deliverables

Task	Activity, Milestone, Deliverable	Anticipated Completion Date
1	Finalize Workplan	July, 2013
3	Final survey guides (in coordination with HPwES evaluation)	September, 2013
4	Data collection complete	November, 2013
5	Draft Final Report	January, 2014
5	Final Report	February, 2014

Staffing

Table 5-3 presents the estimated hours each staff category will spend on the evaluation.

Table 5-7. Project Staff

Staff Category	Estimated Hours	Tasks
President	7	Review workplan, data collection instruments, draft report documents, coordination with NYSERDA
Project Director	40	Oversight and trouble shooting, review notes and reports, strategize approach to project, writing
Senior Project Analyst	50	Update survey and interview guides, update CBO metrics with results from follow-up interviews
Project Analyst	351	Conduct in-depth interviews with CBO organizations, analyze and write up findings from contractor and end-user surveys
Administrative	20	Format final report
Total	468	

Data Collection

Table 5-8 presents the estimated timeframe for data collection.

Table 5-8. Timeframe

Primary Data Collection Activity	Timeframe
Follow-up interviews with CBOs	Fall, 2013
Surveyed in conjunction with HPwES evaluation	
Survey of CBO HPwES participants	Fall, 2013
Survey of CBO GJGNY Audit recipients	Fall, 2013
Survey of CBO-affiliated contractors	Fall, 2013