

**Green Jobs Green New York (GJGNY)  
Advisory Council Meeting Notes**

December 4, 2013  
1:00pm-4:00pm  
NYSERDA Board Room  
Albany NY

Members of the Green Jobs-Green New York (GJGNY) Advisory Council met via videoconference at NYSERDA's Albany, New York City, and Buffalo offices on December 4, 2013. Telephone access was made available to members who could not be present at a video conference site. Also attending the meeting were NYSERDA staff members, additional staff members from Advisory Council member organizations, and members of the public. The meeting was videotaped and posted on the [GJGNY Advisory Council page of NYSERDA's website](#).

**Attendees—**

**Albany Office:**

Lisa Rosi, NYS Department of Public Service; Jordan Stutt, Pace Energy and Climate Center; Paul Shatsoff, Workforce Development Institute; Michael Gorman, NYS Homes and Community Renewal; Anthony Joseph, NYS Department of Labor. Members of the public: Adam Flint, Cornell Cooperative Extension; Guy Kempe, Rural Ulster Preservation Company; Cara Tromans, Conservation Services Group; Keith Corneau, Empire State Development. NYS Energy Research and Development Authority: Karen Hamilton, Adele Ferranti, Frank Mace, Linda Miller, Susan Andrews, Michael Colgrove, Kevin Carey, Jeff Pitken, Carley Murray, Susan Moyers, Alex Talamo, Caroline Ruess, additional NYSERDA staff.

**NYC Office:**

Anthony Ng; Center for Working Families; Stephan Edel, Center for Working Families; Rick Cherry Community Environmental Center. Members of the Public: Esteban Duran, El Puente; Elana Bulman, Pratt Center for Environmental Conservation; Marriele Robinson, Long Island Progressive Coalition; Chuck Schwartz, LI Green. NYS Energy Research and Development Authority: John Rhodes.

**Phone:**

Kate Fish, Adirondack North Country Association; David Hepinstall, Association for Energy Affordability; Les Bluestone, Blue Sea Construction; Anne Reynolds, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation; Gregg Collar, NYS Department of Public Service; Bill Johnson, Green America Public Private Partnership; Jay Ackley, Community Environmental Center; Danielle Panko, NYS Department of State; Chuck Bell, Consumers' Union; Dick Kornbluth, Building Performance Contractors' Association; Members of the public: Will Schweiger, Efficiency First NY.

The following meeting notes capture discussions, questions, and comments held at the meeting in response to the presentations given by NYSERDA staff. A copy of the presentations and any handouts provided can be found at the [GJGNY Advisory Council page of NYSERDA's website](#).

## **I. Welcome and Introductions (John Rhodes)**

John Rhodes welcomed participants to the 24th meeting of the Green Jobs-Green New York Advisory Council, introducing himself as the president and CEO of NYSERDA in addition to being the Chair of the Green Jobs-Green New York Advisory Council.

## **II. Budget Adjustment (Karen Hamilton)**

Presentation materials are provided on the [GJGNY Advisory Council page of NYSERDA's website](#).

Karen Hamilton began by updating participants on the Green Jobs-Green New York budget. NYSERDA is funding the Residential audit component for next year by reallocating \$4.8M in funds with \$800,000 coming out of the Multifamily loan fund and \$4M coming out of the Small Commercial loan fund. This choice was made based on the level of activity in those two loan funds to date.

There is \$5.5M as the balance in the Multifamily loan fund, although there are a number of loans in process that are not yet committed. Michael Colgrove is looking at opportunities the Green Bank might afford the Multifamily sector in the future. NYSERDA is looking at the current Multifamily loan fund as a bridging activity until more aggressive loan activity can be pursued through the Green Bank.

The decision to take \$4M from the Small Commercial loan fund was based on that sector being slow to get involved in loan activity, being a risk averse sector that focuses on payback measures. NYSERDA understands that there may be more activity from this sector moving forward, given recent changes regarding the new availability of funding for photovoltaics (PV). NYSERDA will watch the balance of the loan fund, monitoring for heightened activity.

The current budget for residential audits will be fully committed by the end of 2013. The budget changes were made in order to retain the availability of free and reduced-cost audits in this sector going into next year. NYSERDA expects this reallocation will last through 2014. Next year, plans for budgeting beyond 2014 will be considered.

*Question:* There is a deficit in the Small Commercial audit item. Will that be carried over?

*NYSERDA response:* That is a function of how solicitations are reflected. A competitive solicitation was posted in addition to a program opportunity notice advertising the audits. The amount shown as commitments reflects the original amounts posted in those solicitations, and do not yet reflect reductions resulting from contracts that have been put in place, such that the nearly \$1M deficit does not exist in actuality.

*Question:* Is the balance changed on account of the reallocations?

*NYSERDA response:* The balance based on the current budget, prior to the reallocations, which are in progress.

*Question:* Is this reallocation happening in addition to a previous reallocation that has already occurred?

*NYSERDA response:* Yes. This is the second reallocation made to the Residential audits budget.

### **III. A01245/S01111 – Expansion of Financing to Include Technologies Eligible for Net Metering (Karen Hamilton)**

Presentation materials are provided on the [GJGNY Advisory Council page of NYSERDA's website](#).

The Green Jobs law has been expanded to additional measures. As defined by the legislation, the measures are those eligible for net metering. Specific measures include: photovoltaics, wind, biomass, fuel cells, fuel cells using renewable fuels, anaerobic digestion, small hydroelectric, CHP/cogeneration, and microturbines. Certain measures have size limitations associated with them. A listing of the details of these restrictions can be found online at

[http://www.dsireusa.org/solar/incentives/incentive.cfm?Incentive\\_Code=NY05R&re=0&ee=0](http://www.dsireusa.org/solar/incentives/incentive.cfm?Incentive_Code=NY05R&re=0&ee=0)

All of the listed measures become eligible for funding under Green Jobs-Green New York, however the cost of some of these measure are significantly higher than the limits on GJGNY loans. NYSERDA anticipates funding requests primarily regarding photovoltaics. Other systems would require extremely high down payments. All other rules for financing still apply, including those related to on-bill recovery financing and meeting the cost effectiveness test.

The new eligible measures are being rolled into NYSERDA's existing loan terms, with the same qualification criteria applying. Tier 1 and Tier 2 financing will still be offered. Opportunities to support renewables through the Green Bank are also under consideration. NYSERDA is currently working toward updating all forms related to loan origination, related tools, and the website to reflect the changes. Roll out will occur near mid-January 2014. Loan participation trainings for CBOs and PV installers are planned. The Advisory Council will be updated.

*Question:* Is it an oversight that solar thermal is not included on the list?

*NYSERDA response:* It is not an oversight that solar thermal is not included on the list. Solar thermal was previously eligible under Green Jobs-Green New York. In addition, solar thermal is not a net metered technology.

*Question:* Will there be any training for NYSERDA's efficiency contractors on how to coordinate this with energy efficiency projects?

*NYSERDA response:* Yes. NYSERDA is examining best practices for combining in a single loan PV and energy efficiency. There will be training for contractors in all sectors.

*Question:* How will these changes affect the previously released PON regarding solar thermal?

*NYSERDA response:* Answer: NYSERDA has an ongoing solar thermal open-enrollment incentive program.

*Question:* Will these changes help that opportunity?

*NYSERDA response:* This expansion of the law does not address solar thermal, which was already an eligible measure. No loan has been issued for solar thermal so far.

### **IV. Workforce Development Update: Clean Energy On-the-Job Training (Adele Ferranti)**

Presentation materials are provided on the [GJGNY Advisory Council page of NYSERDA's website](#).

Adele Ferranti acknowledged Rebecca Sterling Hughes as the lead on the On-the-Job training solicitation. In addition she acknowledged Ruth Pillittere, Amy Savoie, and Ryan Curran from the NYS Department of Labor for their work on the program.

The Workforce Development program began in 2011, working closely with the NYS Department of Labor to implement and coordinate this program. The On-the-Job Training (OJT) program is facilitated through an open-enrollment solicitation with a straight forward application process. Revisions have been made to the associated program opportunity notice (PON 2033) to streamline and enhance it. It has been a successful model for NYSERDA. SBC funds have been added so the program can incorporate other technology areas and other sectors. Funds are tracked and monitored separately.

The program helps companies hire new workers and identify the skills they need to perform the jobs they need to fill. An on-the-job training plan is customized to meet existing skills gaps and help employers bring in new employees, which reduces the risk to employers.

The program is designed to teach trainees technical occupational skills rather than administrative tasks. NYSERDA works with NYS DOL to provide good communication with partners to identify what jobs are eligible. The maximum on-the-job training award for an individual is \$15,000, covering 50 percent of wages for that individual. An employer can be subsidized up to \$150,000. NYSERDA averages a \$7,000-\$10,000 share per employee.

NYSERDA is in the process of making additional revisions to PON 2033 to focus on new hires. Difficulties with advancing incumbent workers and off-site training motivate these revisions. Moving forward, funding will be available to support new hires only. Funding for off-site training will be eliminated. New training contracts are being developed with a wide range of training initiatives that will be offered across the state in early 2014. NYSERDA will direct participants to the training partners, and tuition subsidies will be received through NYSERDA training partners.

Data for the OJT program across sectors through September 2013 show 53 companies participated in the program, allowing for 218 new hires and 20 incumbent workers advanced. Some companies have hired as many as 10-12 employees. This corresponds to roughly \$1.27M in funding primarily wage subsidies. An average of about \$45,000 per company is awarded. The average individual worker wage is over \$16 per hour for entry-level technical positions. If additional funds are available and the program requires more support, additional funds can be added as approved by management. Combined for OJT and SBC, there is about \$2.8M in the PON, with \$883,000 still available.

NYS Department of Labor data from 2013 show that out of 226 hires the regional breakdown is as follows: Long Island 45, Mid-Hudson 34, Finger Lakes 25, Central New York 24, Southern Tier 24, Capital Region 21, Western New York 20, New York City 12, Mohawk Valley 11, North Country 0.

Aggregated data from NYS Department of Labor breaks out the education level of hires, showing that most OJT hires have a college degree (27 percent) or high school diploma (32 percent). Fewer OJT hires have some college education (22 percent) or less than a high school diploma (10 percent). Previous work experience shows participants coming primarily from the building trades sector. A variety of other sectors are represented, including retail, trucking, and cable installation. The number of hires who do not successfully complete OJT is relatively low, and this does not prevent a company from approaching NYSERDA to fund the next viable trainee.

*Question:* Is there a long term tracking effort regarding those who leave training or how long OJT hires maintain employment?

*DOL response:* DOL tracks this information through the NYS Career Center case management system. We combine this with other on-the-job training programs to try to find the package that best suits a particular business. The extent to which this happens is relatively immaterial.

*NYSERDA response:* NYSERDA WFD is working closely with the Evaluation team to do surveys with employers, which will materialize good data.

*Question:* It was mentioned that because of SBC funds, the program could be applied to for non-Green Jobs-Green New York energy efficiency work. Has anybody used it that way yet?

*NYSERDA response:* Quite a few companies have done so for advanced lighting and photovoltaics, for example, representing about \$600,000 in SBC funds.

*Question:* Some feedback has indicated a lack of BPI subsidized trainings for existing employees. Is there a plan for additional BPI subsidized trainings to be incorporated?

*NYSERDA response:* NYSERDA is in the process of contract negotiations with 17 training partners to roll out a schedule of two years worth of trainings for many BPI-related trainings. Some of those contracts should be up and running in a matter of two months with partners that have existing curriculum. Dozens of trainings will be available across the state at 50 to 60 percent subsidy per year per student for training costs.

*Question:* Will the focus be on new hires for the Spanish language training programs at LaGuardia?

*NYSERDA response:* LaGuardia is developing the curriculum and translating it into Spanish with a plan to train 120 people.

*Question:* Is the new BPI training already referred to funded through SBC or will it be available on Long Island?

*NYSERDA response:* The new BPI-related contracts mentioned are all SBC funds, though there are funds through Green Jobs-Green New York available to meet the needs of Long Island. NYSERDA can revisit that with program staff to see what the needs are in Long Island.

*Question:* With respect to data about hires, is it possible to incorporate race and income data to these statistics in order to understand who is benefiting from this program?

*DOL response:* Race data is part of the general demographic data collected. Wage data would be developed from the reimbursements.

*NYSERDA response:* A wage information spreadsheet has been made available in the past.

*Question:* Do you collect information about income level as individuals come into the Career Centers? Analysis could be done about how their incomes have increased. How granular is the data you are collecting?

*DOL response:* It is challenging to get a handle on what an individual earned prior to entering the NYS Career Center system. Quarterly wage record data is available through Tax and Finance. Employment history can provide a gauge of what individuals were earning on a quarterly basis. This may be something to be explored by the evaluation group.

*Comment:* This is a good idea for another way to talk about the results of the program in order to see tangible impacts on income.

*Comment:* It would be interesting to see the impacts, not only on the individuals hired, but also on those being hired by contractors—to put together a job creation impact of Green Jobs-Green New York.

*NYSERDA response:* The evaluation that NYSERDA recently conducted for the jobs impact analysis involved primary data from participating contractors and others participating in the Green Jobs-Green

New York program. Reporting on the employee level was very sensitive and employers were not interested in sharing that information with us. There is a limit on what information they will share with us when researching impacts. NYSERDA can see what other data is available for future analysis.

## **V. Public Input (John Rhodes)**

John Rhodes invited members of the public to speak.

*Question:* From a straw poll, many CBOs across the state have significantly fewer human resources now than in prior funding rounds, largely because of the absence of ARRA funding. Is there contemplating more funding in general and over longer periods with this kind of outreach? Solar installers in Broome County report triple the Client acquisition cost of that in Germany because the market has not been established. Is there a plan to increase the outreach budget?

*NYSERDA response:* NYSERDA had not envisioned CBO outreach for PV. PV Incentive money is running out, and there are applications summing \$5M in the queue that remain unfunded. NYSERDA has a proposal for how to change the PV program moving forward to facilitate greater growth.

*Comment:* When CBOs are out in the field, the one-stop approach seems to be best. The suggestion is to look at this holistically and get elected officials to see the value of that, especially given the Green Bank initiative.

*NYSERDA response:* The primary goal of the CBOs, based on the budgets provided, is outreach for energy efficiency improvements.

*Question:* When will the evaluation results that CBOs participated in during the summer be available?

*NYSERDA response:* The CBO-specific evaluation should be available in late January 2014. The jobs analysis report should be ready in the upcoming weeks.

*Comment:* With reference to CBOs promoting solar PV in NYC: PV can be used to draw people into the energy efficiency programs, including Home Performance.

*Question:* Is NYSERDA doing any collaboration with Hurricane Sandy Recovery program Build It Back, as there may be an opportunity there?

*NYSERDA response:* To the extent possible, NYSERDA has been coordinating with Sandy relief work. It is challenging to get into the process at exactly the right point. A lot of the renovation work is not a smooth, straightforward process. Incorporating energy efficiency work has been challenging. The EmPower program has been looking into how the program can support relief efforts. Additional information on opportunities is welcome.

*Question:* The contractor website for RGGI funding shows early November numbers, when will they be updated?

*NYSERDA response:* NYSERDA does not have a current update. The next RGGI auction is taking place soon with results available next week.

*Question:* Has there been any determination on expanding free audit dollars?

*NYSERDA response:* As was shown in the budget presentation, funding is being reallocated.

*Comment:* An observation about turnaround of project flow on Long Island. There is a very slow turn around on free audit approvals and on financing programs and jobs acceptance. There were supposed to be improvements that we are not seeing. Time will kill these deals. Time between approved loans and

consummated loans is too great. Private business can get turnaround on funding in 20 minutes. This should be examined moving forward.

*NYSERDA response:* Suggestion to contact the Creating an Industry Working Group. NYSERDA has seen turnaround times significantly reduced. If a company is not having the same experience, that company should contact John Ahearn. Regarding financing, NYSERDA is working with EFS to streamline processes, including more direct contractor involvement with the process.

#### **VI. Closing Remarks and Next Steps (John Rhodes)**

John Rhodes concluded the meeting. The next meeting not yet scheduled but will be held in March 2014. NYSERDA is in the process of filling expired Advisory Council terms. Meeting notices will be sent out after the first of 2014. Rhodes thanked participants for their support and partnership, and wished everyone a safe and happy holiday season.