

**Green Jobs-Green New York (GJGNY)  
Advisory Council Meeting Notes**

May 16, 2017

1:00 pm – 4:00 pm

NYSERDA Board Room

Albany, New York

Members of the Green Jobs-Green New York (GJGNY) Advisory Council met via videoconference at NYSERDA's Albany, Buffalo, and New York City offices on May 16, 2017. Telephone access was made available to members who could not be present at a video conference site. Also attending the meeting were NYSERDA staff members, additional staff members from Advisory Council member organizations, and members of the public. The meeting was videotaped and posted on the [GJGNY Advisory Council meetings page of NYSERDA's website](#).

**Attendees**

**Albany Office:**

Advisory Council Members: John Rhodes, NYSERDA

NYSERDA: Karen Hamilton; Jeff Pitkin; Adele Ferranti; Kelly Tyler; Jessica Waldorf; David Sandbank; Donovan Gordon; Tracey DeSimone; other NYSERDA staff

**New York City Office:**

Advisory Council Members: Ellen Redmond, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers; Andrew Bryk, Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance; Lisa Tyson, Long Island Progressive Coalition

NYSERDA: Emily Dean; John Joshi; Sharon Griffith

Members of Public: Tom Carey, New York State Homes and Community Renewal

**Phone:**

Advisory Council Members: Paul Shatsoff; PS Consulting; Tanya Dugal, NYS Department of Public Service; Tony Joseph, NYS Department of Labor; Conrad Metcalf, Building Performance Contractors Association; William Johnson, Green America Public Private Partnership; Hal Smith, Halco; Clarke Gocker, People United for Sustainable Housing (PUSH) Buffalo

Members of Public: Kathleen Langton, Affordable Housing Partnership Home Ownership Center; Vincent Ravaschiere, Empire State Development; Jared Snyder, Department of Environmental Conservation; Valerie Strauss, Association for Energy Affordability

**1. Welcome and Introductions**

John Rhodes welcomed participants to the Green Jobs-Green New York (GJGNY) Advisory Council meeting and reviewed the agenda.

**2. Residential Loan Fund Review and Residential Energy Efficiency Program Update**

(Slides 3-27)

Karen Hamilton, Director of Single Family Residential, provided a presentation summarizing the changes and updates of the Residential Loan Fund and Energy Efficiency Programs. The presentation covered: A background of why the interest rate structure was changed, data analysis that depicted the effect these changes have had on loan volume, income distribution, project type, and market rate vs. assisted, elimination of incentives for market rate customers and changes to the cap for the Home Performance with Energy Star Program, RGGI fund projections from 2016 compared to actuals, results of the survey that was requested of contractors/installers to further understand the impact of the

changes and to gather feedback for further examination of possible program and loan fund progress.

Key Points:

- As a reminder, the new interest rate structure was implemented because the 3.49/3.99% rate was unsustainable—costing more than interest earnings and requiring a significant amount of RGGI funds.
- On 1/1/2017, PSEG became primary incentive provider for their customers, but those customers still have access to the GJGNY loan fund.
- Changes in the application process requires applicants provide income data per household, allowing us to now see which income sector we are serving.

Survey Specific Key Points:

- PV installers want to do bigger projects that don't fall within the financing cap.
- EE contractors find that cost-effectiveness is one of the main issues for not completing a project. This issue also drives many customers who are originally interested in an OBR loan to switch to a SE loan.
- They find it challenging to explain the various interest rates upfront and why customers with lower credit scores can get a better rate.
- Not all decreases in projects are due to the finance and program changes. Mild weather and the cost of fuel also play a factor.
- Some feel NYSERDA marketing and advertising is lacking.
- Need to qualify more disadvantaged customers with low FICO score and higher DTI.
- Many EE contractors and PV installers asked to be contacted regarding the survey. NYSERDA will be following up with these individuals.

Question: Is it fair to say that since more loans are falling into <80% AMI range, others are getting loans elsewhere?

NYSERDA response: It is accurate that the reports are showing that demand for services is down a bit and we are able to identify in the survey results what other loan options are potentially being used.

Question: Where can the slides to the presentation be obtained?

NYSERDA response: They were emailed to the Advisory Council, but they will also be posted on the GJGNY Advisory Council meetings page of NYSERDA's website.

Question: Are you able to correlate the outcomes from last year? We had moved to increased interest rates since we thought higher income customers could go elsewhere and not use as much RGGI dollars. Are the outcomes what NYSERDA was hoping for?

NYSERDA response: The results are consistent with what we expected. It does appear that the higher FICO score customers are finding other financing means. We got the RGGI fund demand down to where it needed to be.

Question: Is the demand from moderate and lower income households what we expected and what we saw in other programs?

NYSERDA response: We are pleased with the level of demand in AHP and it is exceeding our projections for the clean energy fund. That segment of the market we are serving at a greater percentage because they have few choices. We can offer lower interest rate loans to low and moderate households to create a balance in the portfolio. It is a sustainable mix. The previous path was not on the right path. We are also pleased with the performance of payback.

### **3. Workforce Development Working Group Report and Recommendations**

(Slides 28-40)

Adele Ferranti, Program Manager of Workforce Development and Training, provided a presentation summarizing the Workforce Development Working Group Report, still in progress. The presentation covered: working group members, role of CBOs in future workforce training efforts, opportunities to coordinate with the NYS Department of Labor, future directions for working force training efforts, incorporating lessons learned both from within GJGNY programs and other jurisdictions, labor standards, NYSERDA recommendations and response, as well as additional considerations explored by the working group.

#### Key Points:

- Looking at market gaps where training isn't available due to demographics or low technological advancements (EE is primary focus).
- Focusing on supporting building maintenance workers, which could have an OTJ component.
- How to better work with communities? Small contractors feel that hiring halls with a pool of workers is the better way to go, whereas, unions feel that they have a great model and halls aren't needed. Looking to find the best combination for labor supply vs. demand.
- Coordinating with the NYS Department of Labor will assist with state-funded workforce development and job placement activities.

Comment: It's also important to reemphasize that recommendations are needed for the framework that identifies needs in EE and workforce development since the group is so small. It would be nice to have additional feedback from CBOs, contractors, and installers.

Response: We will certainly look into that. If anyone knows of someone who would like to see a draft, please contact the working group.

Comment: There are some concerns with the time frame for moving ahead, considering there is another working group being established. It's possible that it won't be on the streets for another year. Is there a thought to speed up the movement?

NYSERDA Response #1: Funding options are being considered and the role CEF can play to support these opportunities. NYSERDA will dig into it and will get back to this group as soon as possible with an update.

NYSERDA Response #2: There are risks associated with it and an approval process that it has to go through. NYSERDA understands the concern, but we need to go through the implementation procedure and don't want to make promises that cannot be kept. We can promise best efforts to accelerate.

### **4. GJGNY Jobs Analysis**

Tracey DeSimone, Assistant Project Manager of Market Characterization and Evaluation, provided a presentation on the 2016 Advisory Council Jobs Analysis. The presentation covered: study objectives, important notes, review of the phase 1 and phase 2 approach, a summary of the 2014-2015 Jobs evaluation (jobs created, retained, up-skilled, and up-waged), disadvantaged communities, the modeling framework, reported output metrics, and impacts on industry and the GJGNY Program.

### **5. Closing Remarks and Next Steps**

Action item recap:

- Slides need to be available to those that did not receive them.

- NYSERDA needs to work on the recommendation for the workforce working group's focus on timeliness. One way would be to take advantage of PUSH's experience, best practices, and their Hall Model.
- Repeat invitation to join the LMI Working Group
- NYSERDA will be reaching out to those contractors/installers that wanted a call back to discuss the contents of the interest rate and incentive survey.

John Rhodes asked if anyone had any issues with the frequency of the advisory council meetings. There was not feedback, so the meetings will continue at 6 month intervals. He then thanked the Advisory Council participants for their engagement and feedback.