

Just Transition Work Group Meeting 1  
September 17, 2020  
3-5pm

**Working Group Member Attendees**

Doreen Harris – Co-Chair  
Roberta Reardon – Co-Chair  
Commissioner RuthAnne Visnauskas  
John Rhodes  
Gary LaBarbera  
Vincent Albanese  
Omar Freilla  
Henry Garrido  
Patrick Jackson  
Michael Padgett  
Brian Raley  
James Shillitto  
Maritza Silva-Farrell  
Ted Skerpon  
Lara Skinner  
Candis Tolliver  
Randy Wolken

**Other Attendees**

Tory Clark  
Adele Ferranti  
Jamie Dickerson  
Karen Fusco  
Ralph Crawford  
Jane Thompsen  
John Williams  
Yvonne Martinez  
Chris Pinheiro  
Kara Allen  
Alicia Sullivan

Introductions

1. Co-chairs Reardon and Harris welcomed all in attendance and explained logistics and how to participate in the conversation.
2. Co-chair Reardon gave welcome remarks. She noted that:
  - a. These last few months have been challenging and unprecedented - it has been a time of change and reflection. Change is difficult but we have much to be hopeful about as we continue to move New York ever forward.
  - b. It's an exciting time to be a part of Governor Cuomo's bold Clean Energy and Climate Agenda. As part of the Just Transition Working Group, we have an opportunity to build a better future and a greener footprint for New York, together.
  - c. We have some tough tasks ahead, as we endeavor to implement effective, realistic and efficient practices that will reduce our carbon footprint.
  - d. The State's energy and climate policies, and continued commitment to innovation, have made the clean energy sector an engine for job and economic growth.
    - i. The green economy will bring changes to industries all across the state, so it's important that we are ready for these changes.
    - ii. An important part of this will include working closely with our partners in energy intensive and other key New York industries to minimize any negative impacts of change on our workforce.

- e. Workforce development and training will be critical in preparing New Yorkers for these new opportunities.
    - i. Our recommendations will ensure that the jobs created through green infrastructure create quality career opportunities for all New Yorkers.
  - f. Through our collective efforts, we are moving closer toward Governor Cuomo's Clean Energy Standard and pushing forward as a national leader on fighting climate change. Indeed, we are setting an example that all New Yorkers can be proud of. I look forward to working with all of you as we build a better New York.
3. Co-Chair D. Harris gave welcome remarks. She noted that
- a. She took over as Acting President and CEO of NYSERDA in late June and was previously Vice President for Large-Scale Renewables and has been with NYSERDA for about 10 years.
  - b. She has sincere enthusiasm for the matters to take up and recognizes that while many of the topics will pose challenges, we have the chance to blaze a trail here for what a just and equitable transition can and should look like – one that harnesses the state's decarbonization journey as a once-in-a-generation opportunity for job-creation, in-state investment, community growth and revitalization, and more.
  - c. New York and the country and society at large have undergone deep and broad transitions in the past and taking a historical look at how those transitions have played out will offer valuable lessons and perspective to this effort.
  - d. Members of the working group should have received a working group handbook, which provides guidance on roles and responsibilities for the chairs, members, and supporting staff.
  - e. There are several active, high-profile initiatives underway right now that are already taking up the mantle of Just Transition. The large-scale renewable programs certainly represent that work – especially through the labor protections that are embedded in those programs. Some recent news is that a project pursuing 100-200 MW of solar development at the former Cayuga coal plant site in Lansing expects to bid into NYSERDA's annual RFP this fall.
  - f. NYSERDA's clean energy programs prioritize the importance of strong labor standards, and will look to work with this group to better understand the needs and priorities of New York workers and principles/standards that we can stand upon to ensure effective and equitable implementation of the climate law and transitions in our economy.
  - g. NYSERDA's workforce development and training programs are another pillar of our just transition-aligned work especially with regard to job training support for priority populations.
  - h. NYSERDA's Build Ready initiative is also an effort to bring community-driven clean energy projects to fruition, with an emphasis on reusing underutilized/brownfield/C&I sites.
  - i. Harris closed with an observation about the importance of equity and justice in the context of this work. The CLCPA obviously made sure that this working group had environmental justice representation, and I'm very glad those group members will be here to work through these issues alongside members of industry, labor, and beyond.
    - i. Our inquiry here really has to be holistic, as we take action to minimize any "left-behind" effects of the low-carbon transition – including both current participants in the state's economy and commerce, as well as those populations who have historically been left out from opportunities.

4. Each member gave a brief introduction and greeting.
  - a. R. Viskauskas – HCR commissioner – Happy to participate in the Working Group. Noted that she also chairs the Energy Efficiency and Housing panel and is expecting overlap between the two groups.
  - b. J. Rhodes – The Public Service Commission’s role is the regulator of utilities and regulator of energy efficiency programs. The clean energy investments need to generate a whole new band of clean energy jobs and we have to ensure that we do this equitably with a focus on more energy justice for environmentally-burdened communities.
  - c. Gary LaBarbera – President, Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater New York introduced himself and provided his support to this process.
  - d. Vincent Albanese – Noted that he is with LIUNA which is a New York State organizing fund and political action fund. Noted that upwards of 25% of private sector man hours are comprised of some natural gas related work. This is 50,000-80,000 jobs. These are jobs that need to be replaced which is no small task. LIUNA has been organizing and lobbying with the state looking to be helpful to ease the transition for members of LIUNA.
  - e. Omar Freilla – Executive Director of the Green Worker Cooperatives, a nonprofit organization in NYC and the Bronx to create job opportunities and businesses that are owned by their workers for those who have been bearing disproportion burden of the industry. A priority for him is creating opportunity for innovation and green businesses from the ground-up for low income communities of color and having jobs where they are needed lead by people themselves.
  - f. Henry Garrido. – Labor is critical to changes of env. Saw it first hand in Europe. Honored to be here.
  - g. Patrick Jackson –Global Director of Energy at Corning. A priority for him is to make sure the manufacturing base is not disadvantaged. Noted that he wants to see a competitive advantage for NYS industries. He would like to see industries be part of the solution.
  - h. Michael Padgett – Vice President of Energy, Alcoa. Introduced himself and emphasized his interests and support to the process.
  - i. Brian Raley – Introduced himself . Global Foundries, a semiconductor manufacturer. He has always had a GHG reduction focus in his career and is excited by opportunity to be a part of the working group. Looking to supporting the CLCPA in a sustainable way that keeps businesses competitive. Has worked with businesses and competitors across the globe and in New York.
  - j. James Shillitto – Noted that the members of his organization are those who will be most affected because they are those who work in power plants, nuclear plants, distribution and transmission, and gas and steam. Noted that he looks forward to working with the group to ensure we do have a just transition for those who are put out of jobs. People need to continue to have good pay and employment going forward.
  - k. Maritza Silva-Farrell – Noted that its an honor to be part of the committee and group. Her organization is ALIGN, and it works to build coalitions to address income inequality and climate change. Noted that this means we need an equitable implementation of the CLCPA. Her organization is part of NY RENEWS, and they look at implementation as a way to heal the economy from the pandemic as well. We are going to think about not just creating jobs, but careers with unions jobs are critical.

- l. Ted Skerpon – Noted that his organization represents several generation stations. He’s looking forward to working with all on this group to meet challenges of creating good job and wages and careers. Looking for a true just transition – for those workers like those who have come from coal.
  - m. Lara Skinner – Noted that the Cornell ILR does study climate protection policy and training education to unions and worker organizations. It is a resource for labor union to be educated and to be engaged in public debates. There are significant impact to workers in these communities. Want to have these workers protected through the transition to a low carbon economy. She noted particular concern about the lower-wage jobs that are in danger and noted that there needs to be a lot of focus on quality of jobs.
  - n. Candis Tolliver – Her group represents building service workers. They have about 90,000 members in buildings and airports and security officers, working as building maintenance workers. Her members have been working to transition to greener and sustainable buildings for many years. Noted that she is excited to be part of the working group.
  - o. Randy Wolken is with the Manufacturers Alliance of New York represents 120,000 workers primarily in manufacturing. His members know the challenges in the transition but notes that there are also opportunities. New York can have manufacturing grow up smarter, faster, and better and he looks forward to finding these opportunities. Noted that the apprenticeship space is crucial in green and transitioning industries.
5. Statutory requirements and timeline. Cmr. Reardon noted:
- a. All of the JTWG’s work will be grounded in the language of the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act (CLCPA or Climate Act) statute.
  - b. There are seven discrete provisions itemized in the Climate Act, encompassing a number of important and inter-related topics: workforce development, training, impacts on energy intensive industries, power plant closure and reuse, carbon leakage and competitiveness, and more.
  - c. On several items, this group is tasked in an advisory role, providing advice and expertise on workforce training and other related matters. And, as indicated on the slide where the text is red, the language of the Act also requires the JTWG to produce several specific deliverables/outputs, including the identification of energy intensive industries and impacts, the identification of sites of electric generation facilities and issues/opportunities related to the reuse of those sites, the development of recommendations to the Council on all matters within the group’s purview, and lastly a jobs study related to the workforce requirements, opportunities, and transitions implicated in our state’s efforts to combat climate change.
  - d. I’ll note that some of the “identification” tasks that we are given may ultimately flow into the recommendations and/or study that we produce.
  - e. We will get into these responsibilities and tasks in further detail later on in the presentation.
6. High level timeline/Advisory Panel collaboration. Cmr. Reardon noted:

- a. The timeline slide lays out Council and Advisory Panel activities leading into the development of the draft Scoping Plan.
- b. Just Transition Working Group is unique from the Advisory Panels in several ways, so we do not fit squarely into the blue arrow milestones shown on the slide for the APs.
- c. The Jobs study is also a deliverable this WG is responsible for. The study is complex, and we will need through 2021 to complete it.
- d. There will be other activity not reflected in these milestones/deliverables including having collaboration meetings with the six other advisory panels and creating opportunities for key stakeholders and the public to provide input and feedback.

7. E3 Pathways summary presentation

- a. Tory Clark from E3 gave a presentation about the Pathways Analysis. Please see slides for details.
  - i. H. Garrido: is the investment vehicle mechanism for items described. Given what's happening with the economy and state finances, has there been an investment vehicle by the state that could aid investors to ideas we talk about here.
  - ii. H. Garrido: question about solar panels and tariffs. Has there been a slowdown in availability of solar panels that would be an issue in meeting solar goals.
  - iii. V. Albanese – on renewable natural gas and hydrogen gas, most of natural gas pipelines are privately owned. When we make that transition, will the pipe need to be replaced if we switch to the renewable fuels. If that is true, what role will the state play to make the private ownership of the pipeline make that transition?
    - 1. T. Clark: Current NG pipelines can take some hydrogen, but there is a limit. In EU, they are looking at new dedicated pipelines.
    - 2. J. Rhodes – how to drive new investments - the DPS will need to take on this topic in the power generation AP. He will keep this WG informed about this topic from his AP.
    - 3. O. Freilla: On non combustion sources – emissions will increase in this section. Are there emissions targets aimed at the waste sector?
      - a. The model does not have an assumption connected to any specific policy but does take into account some possibilities of reduced waste.
      - b. This was discussed during last CAC. The CLCPA does not specifically put limits on waste, so it has been a question that comes up.

8. Workforce programs. D. Harris noted:

- a. Workforce training efforts are being designed to ensure clean energy companies have a robust supply of new and existing workers with the required occupational skills, credentials and experience.
- b. Providing training and job opportunities to populations that face additional barriers to employment is an important component of developing a robust talent pipeline. A Just

transition will provide disadvantaged workers with career pathways in the clean energy economy

- c. Through Governor Cuomo's Workforce Development Initiative, NYS is supporting strategic regional efforts to meet businesses short-term workforce needs, identify and address industries long-term workforce needs and to build a talent pipeline of new workers to support the growing economy.
  - d. NYSERDA is investing \$108 million to train new and existing workers, providing them with career paths or new skills to advance new technologies.
9. NYS DOL's programs, funded through the Workforce Innovation and Opportunities Act, helps businesses find the skilled workers they need while preparing and training job seekers for employment
- a. Housing and Community Renewal provides training and technical assistance to its weatherization assistance service providers
  - b. Many other organizations and agencies (CUNY, SUNY, NYPA, ESD) partner with training providers such as unions, colleges and universities, non-for profits, etc. to develop training through certificate and degree programs, apprenticeships, continuing education programs, internships, etc.
  - c. We want to emphasize our interest in having the Working Group's input to further inventory workforce development programs that may be relevant to our work here.
10. Future Skills Initiative. A. Ferranti noted:
- a. We are interested in hearing about other clean energy training programs across the state. Please send us any information you may have about other programs.
  - b. We also encourage training providers to visit the Workforce Development Institute's new database for training which includes clean energy training. Training providers can enter information about their training for prospective students that can search the database for training.
11. Spotlight – On-the-Job Training. A. Ferranti noted:
- a. NYSERDA's On-the-Job Training program is a great program to highlight, as it features a collaboration with the NYS DOL, and it provides financial support to businesses hiring new clean energy workers.
  - b. The program is designed to help businesses find workers with the right skills and train them using a training plan that is developed with assistance from DOL and NYSERDA. The goal is to help get the new worker up to full productivity as quickly as possible.
12. Slide 29 - WFD Spotlight WIOA Training and Registered Apprenticeship. Cmr. Reardon noted:
- a. There are two programs NYSDOL administers that we want to spotlight: WIOA, which was mentioned a few slides ago, and Registered Apprenticeship.
  - b. Individual Training Accounts, or ITAs, are the most popular type of training in WIOA and are generally more traditional style training (think classroom training).

- c. The second, most popular type of training funded under WIOA is one that should sound familiar because our partners at NYSERDA mentioned it on the last slide, On-the-Job Training or OJT. With an OJT, the training provider is a business rather than a traditional training provider (like a school), and the participant is actually hired by the business providing the training, allowing them to earn while they learn.
- d. There is potential for both of these types of training to be used to get participants into Clean Energy jobs, be it by enrolling them in related certificate programs using an ITA or developing OJTs with clean energy businesses.
- e. Registered apprenticeship produces skilled workers through a combination of structured on-the-job training with a skilled trainer and trade-specific classroom instruction.
- f. G. LaBarbera would like to have more discussion about apprenticeship programs. There already are existing facilities to meeting the training needed. This is really more about emerging technology.
- g. M. Silva-Farrell brought up budget considerations. How are you thinking about budget issues to be sure to invest smartly in these programs?
- h. Cmr. Reardon noted that we are looking at this from long view and want to work in conjunction with what's there.
- i. A. Ferranti: as we've worked with unions in the past, we've helped them modify their apprenticeship to include innovation. We think there are incremental ways to help quickly. We don't want to provide funds where the market already is—always a consideration when we fund training programs.
- j. H. Garrido: is there thinking about ways for the public sector to be part of it? Developing apprenticeship programs for public sector.
  - i. A. Ferranti: there are opportunities for public sector employees to develop apprenticeship programs. That would be welcome and we are interested in that.

13. Power Plant inventory. D. Harris noted:

- a. NYSERDA Staff have begun conducting preliminary power plan inventory efforts: working with the data that is publicly available in the NYISO Goldbook each year, compiling statements and public filings, and coordinating with other agencies with expertise, including DPS, NYPA, and LIPA.
- b. This inventory has thus far on some of the basic criteria and parameters that would be expected in this type of inquiry: the age of power plants, how often they have been running in recent years, primary fuel type, and again, public statements that have been made in compliance filings to DEC, DPS, NYISO, and in the media.
- c. We also need to identify issues and opportunities presented by the reuse of electric generating facility sites, so as to develop concrete strategies and resources for the beneficial and economically productive reuse of sites, and with processes and procedures to aid host community and workforce transitions to the greatest extent possible.
- d. L. Skinner noted that we should be looking at number and quality of the jobs at each power plant and also the tax based contributions that come from those plants.

14. Jobs study. D. Harris noted:

- a. To start, we'll draw your attention to the Clean Energy industry Report, which is a longitudinal study of clean energy jobs that has been released for the past three years. The next version of this report is due out soon which will show clean energy job growth through 2019 and also have analysis of COVID19 impacts to job levels.
- b. This study will inform the baseline information or the "where we are now" situation, in terms how many and what type of clean energy related jobs are present in New York. From there, the forthcoming study the JTWG is tasked with will address the questions required by the statute.

15. Jobs study – objectives. D. Harris noted:

- a. The next few slides lay out the preliminary, high level approach that NYSERDA and NYSDOL staff have identified for the required study.
- b. We plan that an outside firm with expertise in conducting studies on these matters will be solicited and hired to conduct this research.
- c. We're expecting that to settle on a detailed scope, select a contractor, perform research, and release a study will take at least 9-12 months from now – so not likely released until Q4 2021.
- d. It is our plan to bring a developed study scope back to this group for review at our next meeting, and to have a working session to collect your input and feedback at that time.

16. Jobs Study – Key Outputs. D. Harris noted:

- a. The study would also be identifying the types of jobs that would face disruption while transitioning to a low carbon economy.
- b. Another study output we are considering is a skills mapping exercise that would show the skills of the current workforce with the skills needed in a low carbon economy and mapping jobs paths and training needs based on that comparison.

17. Jobs Study – Recommended Method/Approach. D. Harris noted:

- a. The Approach to these studies is under development and will be fleshed out more as the contractor is selected and the scope of work is defined.
- b. Using that existing research, the contractor would set up a framework of jobs, skills, and job descriptions.
- c. Brian Raley – in the E3 presentation there were further studies and work mentioned. What are timelines and who is doing a lot of this work?
  - i. BR: business competitiveness – that will be in the workplan. Possibly do a subgroup for this.
  - ii. Lara Skinner – are there comparable quality jobs that people can transition to. How can we support creating quality jobs?

18. JTWG draft timeline

- a. This group will get into the workplan development right away with the help of the handbook. Staff will be sending members a template and draft for the workplan



following this meeting and will be seeking feedback to develop and refine that workplan.

- b. Then we will be capitalizing on the expertise we have in this working group to begin discussing and crafting recommendations while also meeting with other advisory panels as needed.
- c. In 2021, the jobs study work will be in full swing, and our recommendations will be delivered to the Climate Action Council.
- d. And while not spelled out explicitly on this timeline of working group activities, there will be opportunities for public input and engagement throughout this process.

17. Next Steps include:

- a. Setting a regular cadence of meetings on Working Group's calendars. We expect our next meeting to be in about a month but we will reach out with details.
- b. In the meantime, Working Group members should reach out to share workforce development programs that your organization may have implemented.