

Just Transition Working Group Meeting #5

December 3rd, 2020 | 1:00-3:00pm

Attendees

- **Co-Chair**, Roberta Reardon, Co-Chair, Commissioner, New York State Department of Labor
- **Co-Chair**, Doreen M. Harris, Co-Chair, Acting President and CEO, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority
- RuthAnne Visnauskas, Commissioner, Homes and Community Renewal
- John B. Rhodes, Chair, New York State Public Service Commission
- Vincent Albanese, Director of Policy and Public Affairs, LIUNA
- Omar Freilla, Founder and Coordinator, Green Worker Cooperatives
- Henry A. Garrido, Executive Director, DC 37
- Patrick Jackson, Director of Global Energy Management, Corning, Inc.
- Gary LaBarbera, President, Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater New York
- Michael Padgett, Vice President of Energy, Alcoa
- Brian Raley, Principal Staff Engineer, Global Foundries
- James Shillitto, President, Utilities Workers Union of America Local 1-2
- Maritza Silva-Farrell, Executive Director, ALIGN
- Lara Skinner, Executive Director, The Worker Institute, Cornell University
- Randy Wolken, President and Chief Executive Officer, Manufacturers Association of Central New York and Manufacturers Alliance

Not in Attendance

- Theodore J. Skerpon, President, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers Local 97 and Chair, Utility Labor Council of New York
- Candis Tolliver, Political Director, 32BJ SEIU

Power Plants Subgroup

- **Power Plants Subgroup**
 - **Power Plants Subgroup**
 - See slide five for information on the Power Plants subgroup membership, including members, supporting agency staff, and cross panel engagement.
 - **Agency Efforts: NYSERDA Just Transition RFP**
 - See slide six for an overview of NYSERDA just transition efforts, including:
 - Funding for power plant host communities around site planning and reuse
 - Just Transition Request for Information (RFI) for Site Planning Resources
 - Request for Proposals (RFP) 4563 “Just Transition Technical Assistance and Planning Services”
 - Program Opportunity Notice (PON) allowing communities to submit applications to receive funding and assistance from qualified contractors

- **Agency Efforts: NYSDOL Rapid Response**
 - See slide seven and eight for an overview of NYSDOL’s Rapid Response Services, which are services provided to businesses and workers affected by cutbacks and site closings.
 - Recent examples include both Somerset Operating and Indian Point.
 - **Discussion:**
 - **Henry:** Do you provide services for non-profit entities?
 - **Response:** Yes. These services available across state
 - **Lisa:** Curious about the responsibility of the plant owners in these programs. For example, are the plant owners putting money into early retirement benefits or other kind of job relocation opportunities for the workers?
 - **Steve Ryan:** In dealing with Indian point, the company has many facilities and is offering transfer opportunities to workers. They are working with a couple hundred that will be impacted. Overall, businesses are really grateful when they come in and have generally been responsive.
 - **Follow up from Lisa:** How much funding/revenue are plant owners expected to put into these programs?
 - **Steve Ryan:** These services are funded by the U.S. Department of Labor. In other words, these are services allocated from federal government and run at state level. There is no cost to businesses at all.
 - **Omar:** In the rapid response work, is there any attention paid to possibilities of offering laid off employees an opportunity to purchase the business? Furthermore, are there opportunities or support for those that want to create a new business?
 - **Steve Ryan:** Regarding the first question, the employee stock ownership program has been around where employees buy the business and keep in the community. It’s an expensive initial cost, but a valuable program. As far as self-employment opportunities, they work closely with business services and career center staff and do provide self-employment program and help individuals open their own businesses.
 - **Follow up from Omar:** ESOPs are expensive and typically for fairly large businesses, but this isn’t the only kind of employee ownership option. Worker cooperatives are another form and are simpler. There are a few avenues for moving this forward
 - **Commissioner Reardon:** Good point and would like to hear more about cooperatives.
 - **James:** Does the state reach out to these plants? If a plant gets slated to shut in 2025, will the state reach out to them or do we wait for companies to let us know they’ll be facing layoffs. It could be valuable to provide incentives or training while they’re still working at the plant

- **Commissioner Reardon:** Great suggestion. Typically what happens with rapid response is it is triggered by a warn notice. But in these cases, we'll know in advance what is coming so we should have a framework for this process without a warn notice. Need as long a runway as possible to have to best impact. Agree that the 90 days of the warn notice is not enough time
- **Agency Efforts: Exploring Power Plant Jobs Assessment**
 - **Overall approach:** Provide similar resources/support for skills-mapping for power plan workforce
 - **Overall Question:** How best can granular data be assembled about the current power plan workforce? Can existing or new analyses help tailor/identify opportunity spaces for existing plant worker skillsets?
 - **Overall Concept:** 'Workforce redeploy' assessment with consultant(s) to conduct skills/occupation inventorying, matchmaking, identify re-training/re-skilling paths. Analogous to 'site reuse' program.
 - See slide nine for additional details regarding the Power Plan Jobs Assessment
- **Power Plant Workforce**
 - The existing power plant workforce is a true jewel of New York State and an asset for the future of the energy system, being highly skilled and trainable.
 - The subgroup acknowledges the uncertainty and apprehension facing workings at fossil fuel facilities, and emphasizes the importance of getting this element of a just transition right.
 - See slides 10-11 for additional details on the power plant workforce
 - **Discussion:**
 - **Lisa:** Has some experience with the Somerset-Cayuga coal plant work. Some of the insights she has from that experience include:
 - First, companies need to start putting some funding into a social security system as they've benefitted from this labor and it's fair to think of mechanisms or ways they can put into early retirement or re-training programs.
 - Second, it's important to consider the who and what of these re-training programs and what will best meet the needs. She highlights the need to have good collaboration with existing union programs.
 - And Third, it could be valuable to have high-level principles about what our workers need. In OSW space, ensuring the state invest in ports to make NY a job leader in OSW industry. Other principles may involve project-labor agreements for OSW and prevailing wage. Get a list of those key principles to ensure RE jobs are family supporting jobs.
 - **Darren:** On that breakout, how are dual-fuel units handled? Additionally, he notes it is important to consider the geographic aspect. When recruiting top talent, it's important to get them interested in a location so it is helpful to have a sense of where they are and where they may be going.
 - **John Williams:** Will follow up on dual-fuel question offline

- **Maritza:** Really appreciate the framing of workforce as a jewel. Wasn't clear on the details of Indian point closure and how many workers are we expecting to be impacted there. Also want to elevate two things: 1) need to discuss sources of funding – think about community just transition funds that the state can begin allocating ahead of time to support the training; and 2) not losing track of benefits. Many of these workers have benefits that we don't see right now in other sectors so need to ensure prevailing wages and benefits are considered in just transition.
 - **James:** In regard to Indian Point, at some point, it was about 1,000 workers. He initially represented about 400 workers, but this has dropped down below 200 now that part of the plant has shut down. Once next reactor shuts down in spring, it will go down to below 100. There are benefits as the contract with Entergy has a successor clause. Been in discussion with subsidiary who will do decommissioning and are upholding contract. When that contract expires in 2022, it is unclear what will happen with remaining 80-90 workers. All different estimates for how long it will go to fully decommission and re-use will take stages. Additionally, there are going to be parts of the property that remain in-use (e.g., canisters with fuel) so there will continue to be security.
- **Omar:** First wanted to support the call for a long runway for training and transitioning workers. He's got 11 years of experience of training and supporting people in forming worker cooperatives and leaving their work to start new businesses. In his experience, is it takes people about 2 years to transition from being dissatisfied and wanting to make a change to actually taking steps to prepare and move forward. For learning a new skill (rather than start a business as has been his experience) it may be shorter, but it could be helpful to quantify "long runway" as 90 days is obviously too short. Also curious regarding Indian Point: going from 1000 to 300 is a big jump, but where have the people gone?
 - **James:** From his perspective, Entergy offered all employees opportunities within their fleet. A lot of younger people who wanted to stay in industry moved to other places. Those near retirement have retired, and others will stay through completion of the reactor and then they'll retire. For those in the middle, there is an opportunity to use their skills to get into OSW.
 - **Commissioner Reardon:** this is a great conversation but unfortunately need to move forward on the agenda.
- **Overview of Power Plant Work-Products**
 - Two main deliverables, including:
 - A power plant inventory
 - Identification of issues and opportunities presented by site reuse
 - See slide 12 for more information
- **Power Plant Subgroup: Age of the Power Plant Fleet**

- NYISO, 2018 Power Trends Report: growing amount of gas- and steam-turbine capacity reaching age threshold
 - However, 35% of New York’s current generating capacity has been added since 2000.
 - See slide 14 for additional details.
 - **Discussion:**
 - **Lara:** Of the generating capacity that is newer, what type has mostly been added?
 - **Response:** A lot of the new generation has been natural gas and a lot of wind generation. Will follow up with the numbers.
 - **Emilie:** 2,000 MW of natural gas combined cycle generation, 2,000 MW large scale wind, a lot of solar thus far is behind the meter.
- **Power Plant Subgroup: Public Policy Drivers**
 - Overview of key public policy drivers impacting the landscape, including:
 - CLPCA
 - CO2 performance standards for major electric generating facilities
 - Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) regulations
 - DEC “Peaker Rule” Ozone season regulations
 - New York City’s residual oil elimination
 - See slide 15 for more details
- **Power Plant Inventory: Objectives and Approach**
 - See slide 16 for an overview of the inventory’s key objectives and proposed approach.
 - **Discussion:**
 - **Lisa:** Related to the bullet under proposed approach which suggests a focus on metrics, she wonders if there is an equity screen – e.g., looking at communities most impacted by pollution sources and including this as one of the metrics and data points to be looking at.
 - **Respond:** good point
 - **Lara:** Considering the quality of the jobs that currently exist, will there be similar quality jobs for folks to transition to? Also, what are the industries that exist in the region? Can we provide tax credits to encourage the development of those industries. Making sure there is privilege given to impacted members to receive jobs at those new sites/industries.
 - **Response:** Great feedback, will make sure to capture this.
- **Power Plant Inventory: Overview of initial data categories**
 - See slide 17 for full list of categories for which the inventory would provide available information.
- **Power Plant Inventory: Illustrative Examples**
 - See slide 18 for illustrative examples highlighted announced/in-progress retirements (since passage of CLCPA)
- **See slides 20-27 for additional information related to:**
 - Recent retirements (via NYISO Generator Status Update report)

- Emissions compliance and proposed generator status changes to comply with DEC peaker rule.
- Issues and opportunities presented by site reuse
- Case studies

Just Transition Principles

- **Just Transition Principles**

- See slide 29 for a reminder of the categories discussed at the November 4th meeting, which emerged from a literature review and additional desk research.
- See slides 30-31 for draft/straw proposal principle language for review.
- Discussion:
 - **Maritza:** One thing she wanted to mention to keep close, is the importance of maintaining our public land and public funding so we don't rely only on private funding for just transition work.
 - **Omar:** All of these are really spot on, however, he flags the use of the phrase "sustainable and economic development and growth" on the last category. The word "growth" can mean many things to many people and some things don't need to grow. Growth in some cases can result in destruction.
 - **Kara:** Good feedback – would you rather it end at development or does the sustainable aspect help?
 - **Omar:** Thinks ending it with sustainable economic development would be good, as growth could be read as being apart from that.
 - **Randy:** Thinks by having sustainable, it does put a boundary around growth. Thinks growth is an important element of what we're going for here so think it's important to maintain growth as a strategy. It needs to be sustainable, but think it's important to focus on growth.
 - **Kara:** Perhaps we can think about how we can go about making sure this is strong and speaks to both development and growth in a positive
 - **Henry:** He is proud of labor sensitivity and not just doing this for the sake of decarbonization, but also to protect workers. It speaks volumes to the issue of not just principles and strategies, but values that the state has taken on. Friendly suggestion – if there is a way to start putting that in one of these, it would be appreciated.
 - **Yvonne:** Agrees that this is one of the key aspects of the work we're doing, and highlights that they do call out in particular union jobs within the draft principle language because it is important.
 - **Lara:** To build on what Henry was saying is that today's meeting shows there is some great thinking happening. Raises the question of how we link some of this up. How to make sure approach to just transition is comprehensive and cohesive. How to connect it all. DOL rapid response was set up to deal with individual plant and business closures – when we think about this transition, we are thinking about a major economic transition, so our responsive needs to be commensurate. Just transition funds are incredibly important. How do we map

out this transition. Started to do so with the inventory. Suggests looking at Tammy Duckworth legislation in IL.

- **Maritza:** Seconds the comments made by Lara – looking at the issue with a wholistic lens is the right way to go. Do want to emphasize the importance of considering racial justice – e.g., how are we doing the re-training through racial justice lens.
- **Kara:** Asks folks to share feedback by next Thursday

Preview: JTWG Report-Out to CAC

- **Just Transition Workstreams**
 - See slides 33-37 for a preview of the JTWG report out to the CAC, including workstreams one through five.
 - Discussion:
 - **Kara:** Asks for feedback by next Thursday

Closing:

- **See slides 38-39 for information on other updates and next steps, including**
 - The next JTWG Meeting: January 6th from 1-3pm