NEW YORK ENERGY $MART[SM] PROGRAM EVALUATION AND STATUS REPORT

REPORT TO THE SYSTEM BENEFITS CHARGE ADVISORY GROUP

INTERIM REPORT
SEPTEMBER 2000

NEW YORK STATE
ENERGY RESEARCH AND
DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

New York Energy $mart℠ Program
Evaluation and Status Report

Interim Report to the System Benefits Charge Advisory Group

State of New York
George E. Pataki, Governor

New York State Energy Research and Development Authority
William R. Howell, Chairman
F. William Valentino, President

NOTICE

This report was prepared by the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (hereafter NYSERDA) its evaluation assistance contractors: Oak Ridge National Laboratory (ORNL); and GDS Associates, Inc., and its subcontractor, Megdal & Associates, (hereinafter "Contractor"). The opinions expressed in this report do not necessarily reflect those of NYSERDA or the State of New York, and reference to any specific product, service, process, or method does not constitute an implied or expressed recommendation or endorsement of it. Further, NYSERDA, the State of New York, and the Contractor make no warranties or representations, expressed or implied, as to the fitness of particular purpose or merchantability of any product, apparatus, or service, or usefulness, completeness, or accuracy of any processes, methods, or other information contained, described, disclosed, or referred to in this report. NYSERDA, the State of New York, and the Contractor make no representation that the use of any product, apparatus, process, method, or other information will not infringe privately owned rights and will assume no liability for any loss, injury, or damage resulting from, or occurring in connection with, the use of information contained, described, disclosed, or referred to in this report.

ABSTRACT

This report presents information on the status of, and preliminary findings from, the ongoing evaluation of the **New York Energy $mart**[SM] public benefits program. This report, together with the continuous tracking of program progress, serves as an integral component to determining the outcomes and ultimate success of the **New York Energy $mart**[SM] program in meeting New York's public policy goals. This Interim Report, will help NYSERDA to assess progress and modify programs as necessary to improve program performance, and guide development of future program efforts.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many people were involved in authoring and contributing to this report. From NYSERDA we would like to acknowledge the contributions of Paul DeCotis, Jennifer Ellefsen, Helen Kim, and Mark Coleman, and the many project and program managers at NYSERDA that contributed information for this report. From the Contractor team we would like to acknowledge the contributions of Scott Albert, and Richard Spellman, GDS Associates, Inc.; Lori Megdal, Megdal & Associates; and Sharyn Barata, B&B Resources, Inc. From Oak Ridge National Laboratory, we would like to acknowledge the contributions of John Munro, Joel Eisenberg, and Ron Young. In addition, we would like to recognize Tom Rooney, GDS Associates, Inc.; Tom Giffin and Lina Kohandoust-Hellman, SAIC; for their contributions to the Standard Performance Contract program Case Study (Appendix A).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SEPTEMBER 2000

PAGE

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION S-1
BUDGETING AND FINANCIAL STATUS S-2

PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION STATUS S-4
Process Results S-5
Progress Results Toward Program Goals S-6

CONCLUSION S-11

SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION

INTRODUCTION 1-1
Program Evaluation 1-5

PROGRAM FUNDING AND OVERVIEW 1-6
Reprogramming of SBC Funds 1-7

PROGRAM OVERVIEW 1-8
Energy Efficiency Services Programs 1-9
Low-Income Energy Affordability 1-11
Research & Development and Environmental Protection Programs 1-13

SECTION 2: EVALUATION APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

EVALUATION OVERVIEW 2-1
EVALUATION PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION 2-2
Step 1: Identify Goals and Objectives 2-4
Step 2: Define Key Success Indicators 2-6
Step 3: Manage Data Collection 2-7
Step 4: Assess Progress and Intermediate Outcomes 2-8
Step 5: Evaluation of Process, Outcomes and Causality 2-9
Market-Based Evaluation 2-11
Determining Program Effectiveness in Developing Markets 2-13

SECTION 3: PROGRAM DESIGN LOGIC

INTRODUCTION 3-1

MARKET EVENTS AND ACTIVITIES 3-1

MARKET STRUCTURE AND MARKET ACTORS 3-3
Midstream Market and Market Actor Perspectives 3-4
Standard Performance Contracting 3-5
Commercial New Construction 3-5
Residential Appliances and Lighting 3-5

MARKET BARRIERS 3-6

PROGRAM INTERVENTION STRATEGIES 3-7
RESIDENTIAL SECTOR - APPLIANCES AND LIGHTING 3-9
RESIDENTIAL LIGHTING MARKET 3-10
Barriers in the Residential Lighting Market 3-11
Barriers in the Residential Appliance Market 3-12
Intervention Strategies and Residential Appliance and Lighting 3-14

LOW-INCOME SECTOR AND ENERGY EFFICIENCY DEPLOYMENT INITIATIVES 3-21
Barriers to Improving Energy-Efficiency in the Low-Income Sector 3-21
Intervention Strategies and the Low-Income Sector 3-22

COMMERCIAL/INDUSTRIAL SECTOR - LIGHTING, COOLING, AND MOTORS 3-25

COMMERCIAL LIGHTING MARKET 3-25
Market Actors in the Commercial Lighting Market 3-25
Barriers in the Commercial Lighting Market 3-26
Intervention Strategies and the Commercial Lighting Market 3-27

THE COMMERCIAL COOLING RETROFIT MARKET 3-28
Intervention Strategies and the Commercial Cooling Market 3-28

THE COMMERCIAL MOTORS MARKET 3-29
Commercial Motors and Market Structure 3-29
Barriers in the Motors Market 3-30
Intervention Strategy and the Commercial Motors Market 3-32

BARRIERS IN THE COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL SECTOR 3-32
INTERVENTION STRATEGIES FOR THE COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL SECTORS 3-33

RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT SECTOR 3-38
RENEWABLE ENERGY INITIATIVES 3-38
Value-Added Benefits Associated with Renewable Investments 3-38
Renewables Market and Barriers 3-38
Residential PV Market Structure and Functioning 3-40
Residential Photovoltaic Market Barriers 3-41
Intervention Strategies and the PV Market 3-42

REASONABLE THREE-YEAR EXPECTATION OF MARKET TRANSFORMATION PROGRAMS 3-45
NEW YORK STATE'S ASSESSMENT 3-47

SECTION 4: PROCESS AND PROGRESS RESULTS

BUDGET STATUS 4-1
- REPROGRAMMING OF FUNDS 4-2
- ENERGY EFFICIENCY SERVICES 4-3
- LOW-INCOME ENERGY AFFORDABILITY 4-5
- RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT 4-6
- ENVIRONMENTAL DISCLOSURE 4-7
- PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION 4-7

PROCESS REPORTING 4-7
- THE COMPETITIVE SOLICITATION PROCESS 4-7
- SOLICITATION PROCESS 4-9
  - Program Implementation Solicitations 4-9
  - Incentive Offerings 4-10
- PROCESS CYCLE-TIME 4-11
- SOLICITATION PROCESS INTERVIEWS 4-12
  - Solicitation Development and Distribution 4-13
- ADDITIONAL PROCESS-RELATED SURVEY RESULTS 4-17
  - Premium Efficiency Motors Program Participant Survey Results 4-18
  - Residential Appliances and Lighting Program Participant Survey Results 4-19

PROGRESS REPORTING 4-20
- PROGRAM SPENDING 4-20
- CUSTOMERS SERVED 4-24
- PROGRAM ALLIES 4-25
- CO-FUNDING AND LEVERAGING 4-26
- ELECTRICITY SAVINGS 4-28
  - Electric Savings by Sector 4-31
  - Electric Savings by Measure 4-32
  - Electric Savings by Utility Service Area 4-33
- OTHER FUEL SAVINGS 4-35
- ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFITS 4-35
- EARLY INDICATORS OF MARKET EFFECTS 4-36

SECTION 5: PROGRESS TOWARD GOALS

1. IMPROVE EFFICIENCY OF ELECTRICITY USE THROUGH COST-EFFECTIVE ENERGY EFFICIENCY MEASURES AND SERVICES 5-3

2. TRANSFORMING THE MARKET FOR ENERGY-EFFICIENT PRODUCTS AND SERVICES, INFORMING THE PUBLIC ABOUT THE FULL RANGE OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY OPPORTUNITIES 5-5

3. FOSTERING THE ENERGY EFFICIENCY INDUSTRY 5-6

4. ADDRESS THE ENERGY AFFORDABILITY ISSUES OF LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS 5-6

5. INVEST IN PUBLIC BENEFIT ENERGY RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT (R&D) THAT IS UNLIKELY TO BE PROVIDED BY PRIVATE MARKETS, INCLUDING PROMOTING NEW ENERGY TECHNOLOGIES, AND MAINTAINING ENVIRONMENTAL MONITORING AND PROTECTION 5-7

6. ADOPT A BALANCED AND STRATEGICALLY PRIORITIZED PORTFOLIO OF PROJECTS 5-7

SECTION 6: PROGRAM AND PROJECT SUMMARIES

INTRODUCTION 6-1

ENERGY SERVICES INDUSTRY 6-5
STANDARD PERFORMANCE CONTRACT PROGRAM 6-5
INSTITUTIONAL PERFORMANCE CONTRACTING ASSISTANCE PROGRAM 6-8

MARKET TRANSFORMATION 6-9
NEW CONSTRUCTION PROGRAM 6-9
PREMIUM EFFICIENCY MOTORS PROGRAM 6-11
SMALL COMMERCIAL LIGHTING PROGRAM 6-14
COMMERCIAL HVAC PROGRAM 6-16
NEW YORK ENERGY $MART℠ LOAN FUND 6-17
LOAN FUND MULTIFAMILY BUILDING DEMONSTRATION 6-18
INNOVATIVE OPPORTUNITIES: COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL 6-18
RESIDENTIAL APPLIANCES AND LIGHTING AND ENERGY STAR® PUBLIC AWARENESS 6-20
HOME IMPROVEMENT LOAN PROGRAM 6-26
RESIDENTIAL NEW CONSTRUCTION 6-26
RESIDENTIAL BUILDING PERFORMANCE MARKET ENHANCEMENT PROGRAM 6-27
INNOVATIVE OPPORTUNITIES: RESIDENTIAL 6-27

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE 6-29
ENERGY FEASIBILITY STUDIES 6-29
ENERGY OPERATIONS MANAGEMENT 6-30
RATE ANALYSIS AND AGGREGATION 6-31
ENERGY AUDIT PILOT 6-32
FLEXTECH 6-33
COOLING RECOMMISSIONING PROGRAM 6-34
RESIDENTIAL COMPREHENSIVE ENERGY MANAGEMENT SERVICES 6-35

LOW-INCOME ENERGY AFFORDABILITY 6-35
LOW-INCOME DIRECT INSTALLATION 6-35
LOW-INCOME AGGREGATION 6-38
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR PUBLICLY-ASSISTED HOUSING 6-38
AFFORDABLE ASSISTED HOUSING 6-39
LOW-INCOME PUBLIC AWARENESS 6-39

RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT 6-40
NEW YORK STATE WIND PLANT DEMONSTRATION 6-40
WIND PROSPECTING PROGRAM 6-41
RESIDENTIAL PHOTOVOLTAICS 6-41
PHOTOVOLTAICS ON BUILDINGS 6-42
HIGH VALUE PHOTOVOLTAICS AND WIND 6-42
WILLOW PLANTATION DEVELOPMENT 6-43
ENVIRONMENTAL MONITORING, EVALUATION AND PROTECTION 6-43
ENERGY EFFICIENCY AND STRATEGIC R&D 6-47
STATIC INVERTER TEST PROCEDURE DEMONSTRATION 6-51
NEW YORK STATE ENVIRONMENTAL DISCLOSURE 6-52

SECTION 7: CASE STUDIES

NEW CONSTRUCTION PROGRAM 7-3

PREMIUM EFFICIENCY MOTORS PROGRAM 7-9

ENERGY STAR® RESIDENTIAL APPLIANCES AND LIGHTING PROGRAM 7-17

ENERGY OPERATIONS MANAGEMENT PROGRAM 7-25

LOW-INCOME DIRECT INSTALLATION PROGRAM 7-31

ENVIRONMENTAL, MONITORING, EVALUATION, AND PROTECTION (EMEP) 7-37

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A:
STANDARD PERFORMANCE CONTRACT PROGRAM CASE STUDY A-1

APPENDIX B:
MARKET SECTOR ANALYSIS B-1

APPENDIX C:
PROGRAM PROCESS TRACKING C-1

TABLES

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TABLE S-1: Projected Environmental and Economic Impacts, including kWh Savings (in millions) and Demand Savings S-8

TABLE S-2: Summary of Progress Toward Goals S-10

SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION

TABLE 1-1: PSC Approved Reallocation of SBC Funds (May 2000) 1-8

SECTION 2: EVALUATION APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

TABLE 2-1: The **New York Energy $mart**SM Program Logic 2-5
TABLE 2-2: Tracking Key Success Indicators (Logic Model) 2-7
TABLE 2-3: Non-Energy and Value-Added Benefits 2-9

SECTION 3: PROGRAM DESIGN LOGIC

TABLE 3-1: Average Display Space Provided for Energy Star® Products in New York State 3-13
TABLE 3-2: Market Actors, Barriers, and Interventions in the Residential Appliance and Lighting Market 3-16
TABLE 3-3: **New York Energy $mart**SM Residential Programs 3-18
TABLE 3-4: **New York Energy $mart**SM Low-Income Programs 3-23
TABLE 3-5: **New York Energy $mart**SM Commercial Programs 3-34
TABLE 3-6: **New York Energy $mart**SM Research & Development Programs 3-43

SECTION 4: PROCESS AND PROGRESS RESULTS

TABLE 4-1: Program Financial Summary as of June 30, 2000 (in $ Millions) 4-2
TABLE 4-2: Approved Reprogramming of SBC Funds 4-3
TABLE 4-3: Schedule of Solicitations by Major Program Area through June 30, 2000 4-10
TABLE 4-4: Sector Distribution of Funds Awarded & Pending 4-22
TABLE 4-5: Co-funding and Leveraged Investments Funds Awarded & Pending 4-27
TABLE 4-6: Anticipated Annual kWh and Demand Savings by Program 4-29
TABLE 4-7: Derivation of Electricity Savings Estimates 4-30
TABLE 4-8: Failure/Removal Rate of Installed Measures After 4 Years 4-31
TABLE 4-9: Annual kWh Savings (in million kWh) by Measure for Funds Awarded and Pending: Commercial/Industrial Programs 4-32
TABLE 4-10: Annual kWh Savings (in million kWh) by Measure for Funds Awarded and Pending: Residential Sector 4-33
TABLE 4-11: Distribution of Program kWh Savings (in millions) by Utility Service Area 4-34
TABLE 4-12: Oil and Gas Savings From Funds Awarded 4-35
TABLE 4-13: Emission Reductions from Programs Currently Reporting Energy Savings (in tons) .. 4-36
TABLE 4-14: Projected Emission Reductions by Program End - from Programs Currently Reporting Energy Savings (in tons) 4-36
TABLE 4-15: Market Transformation Progress 4-37

SECTION 5: FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

TABLE 5-1: Summary of Progress Toward Goals 5-2
TABLE 5-2: Projected Energy, Economic and Environmental Impacts 5-4
TABLE 5-3: Program Portfolio Balance and Effects 5-9

SECTION 6: INDIVIDUAL PROGRAM REPORTING

TABLE 6-1: Status of Energy Services Industry Programs 6-1
TABLE 6-2: Status of Market Transformation Programs 6-2
TABLE 6-3: Status of Technical Assistance Programs 6-3
TABLE 6-4: Status of Low-Income Energy Affordability Programs 6-3
TABLE 6-5: Status of Research and Development Programs 6-4

INSTITUTIONAL ENERGY PERFORMANCE CONTRACTING ASSISTANCE PROGRAM
TABLE 6-6: Electric Savings by Measure 6-9

RESIDENTIAL APPLIANCES AND LIGHTING AND ENERGY STAR® PUBLIC AWARENESS
TABLE 6-7: Baseline and Follow-up Measurements for Key Indicators 6-23
TABLE 6-8: Summary of Paid Advertising 6-24
TABLE 6-9: Summary of Media Relations 6-24

LOW-INCOME DIRECT INSTALLATION
TABLE 6-10: Geographic Distribution of Applications 6-36
TABLE 6-11: Measures Installed by June 30, 2000 6-36

SECTION 7: CASE STUDIES

APPENDIX A: STANDARD PERFORMANCE CONTRACTING CASE STUDY

APPENDIX B: MARKET SECTOR ANALYSIS

TABLE B-1: Electricity Consumption by Market Sector and End-Usage B-2
TABLE B-2: New York State Residential Sector Traits B-3
TABLE B-3: Residential Energy Use by Utility Service Area B-4
TABLE B-4: Residential Electricity Prices per kWh by Utility Service Area B-4
TABLE B-5: NYS Distributor Sales for Household Appliances to National Sales B-5
TABLE B-6: New York Low-Income Sector Traits B-8
TABLE B-7: New York Commercial Sector Traits B-11
TABLE B-8: Commercial Sector Characteristics in the **New York Energy $mart**℠ Utility Areas . B-12
TABLE B-9: Commercial Electricity Prices per kWh by Utility Service Area B-12
TABLE B-10:Commercial Building Energy Use by Type and End-Use (Mid-Atlantic) 1995 ..... B-15
TABLE B-11: A Look at Energy Conservation in Commercial Buildings, 1995 ..... B-16
TABLE B-12: New York Industrial Sector Traits B-18
TABLE B-13: Industrial Consumption for **New York Energy $mart**℠ Utility Areas B-20
TABLE B-14: Industrial Electricity Prices per kWh by Utility Service Area B-21

APPENDIX C: PROGRAM PROCESS TRACKING

FIGURES

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIGURE S-1: Program Budget Allocation S-3
FIGURE S-2: Financial Summary Through June 30, 2000 ..... S-4
FIGURE S-3: Funds Awarded & Pending Award by Year S-5

SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION

FIGURE 1-1: NYSERDA Activities Schedule 1-3
FIGURE 1-2: Budget Allocation (Total = $177 Million) 1-7
FIGURE 1-3: Energy Efficiency Services (Total = $119.2 Million) 1-9
FIGURE 1-4: Low-Income Affordability (Total = $16.2 Million) 1-11
FIGURE 1-5: R&D Programs (Total = $28.9 Million) 1-13

SECTION 2: EVALUATION APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

FIGURE 2-1: NYSERDA Evaluation Framework 2-3
FIGURE 2-2: Innovation-Decision Process (Rogers, *Diffusion of Innovations*) 2-12
FIGURE 2-3: Framework for Assessing Causality 2-14

SECTION 3: PROGRAM DESIGN LOGIC

FIGURE 3-1: Illustration of Market Events 3-2
FIGURE 3-2: The Residential Lighting Fixture Market 3-11
FIGURE 3-3: Intervention Strategies in the Residential Appliance and Lighting Market 3-17
FIGURE 3-4: National Commercial Lighting Product Flow 3-26
FIGURE 3-5: Generic Product Flow of the Cooling Retrofit Market 3-28
FIGURE 3-6: Market Flow of the Motors Market 3-29
FIGURE 3-7: Comparing Sales of Premium Efficiency Motors to Standard Models in New York State, 1998 3-31
FIGURE 3-8: Solar Collector Shipments by Market Sector, 1998 3-40
FIGURE 3-9: Generic Residential PV Market Product-Flow 3-41

SECTION 4: PROCESS AND PROGRESS RESULTS

FIGURE 4-1: Financial Summary for Energy Efficiency Services 4-3
FIGURE 4-2: Financial Summary for Low-Income Energy Affordability 4-5
FIGURE 4-3: Financial Summary for Research & Development 4-6
FIGURE 4-4: NYSERDA Project Planning and Management 4-8
FIGURE 4-5: Cycle-Time (Median Weeks per Phase) 4-12
FIGURE 4-6: Funds Awarded & Pending by Year 4-21
FIGURE 4-7: Funding Distribution by Sector for Operational Programs 4-23
FIGURE 4-8: Comparison of Funding with Utility Contributions 4-24
FIGURE 4-9: End-use Customers for Selected Operational Programs 4-24
FIGURE 4-10: Participating Program Allies 4-25
FIGURE 4-11: Annual kWh Savings by Market Sector 4-31
FIGURE 4-12: Annual kWh Savings by Measure: C/I Programs 4-32
FIGURE 4-13: Annual kWh Savings by Measure: Residential Sector 4-33
FIGURE 4-14: Annual Electric Savings by Utility Service Area 4-34

SECTION 5: FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

SECTION 6: INDIVIDUAL PROGRAM REPORTING

STANDARD PERFORMANCE CONTRACT PROGRAM
FIGURE 6-1: Dollars Awarded by Measure 6-6
FIGURE 6-2: Number of Projects by Sector 6-6
FIGURE 6-3: Actual and Projected Incentive Awards by Month 6-7

INSTITUTIONAL PERFORMANCE CONTRACTING ASSISTANCE PROGRAM
FIGURE 6-4: Customer Applications by Sector 6-8

NEW CONSTRUCTION PROGRAM
FIGURE 6-5: Actual and Projected Dollar Value of Incentive Applications 6-11

PREMIUM EFFICIENCY MOTORS PROGRAM
FIGURE 6-6: Motors Sales Distribution by Horsepower 6-13
FIGURE 6-7: Actual and Projected Incentives by Month Through Program End 6-14

RESIDENTIAL APPLIANCES AND LIGHTING AND ENERGY STAR® PUBLIC AWARENESS PROGRAM
FIGURE 6-8: Retail Recruits by Location 6-22

ENERGY FEASIBILITY STUDIES
FIGURE 6-9: Dollars Awarded and Co-funding 6-29
FIGURE 6-10: Distribution of Projects by Sector 6-30

ENERGY OPERATIONS MANAGEMENT
FIGURE 6-11: Dollars Awarded and Co-funding 6-30
FIGURE 6-12: Distribution of Projects by Sector 6-31

RATE ANALYSIS AND AGGREGATION
FIGURE 6-13: Dollars Awarded and Co-funding 6-32
FIGURE 6-14: Distribution of Projects by Sector 6-32

ENERGY AUDIT PILOT
FIGURE 6-15: Distribution of Projects by Sector 6-33

FLEXTECH
FIGURE 6-16: Dollars Awarded and Co-funding 6-34
FIGURE 6-17: Distribution of Projects by Sector 6-34

LOW-INCOME DIRECT INSTALLATION
FIGURE 6-18: Funding of Installed Measures by Source 6-37
FIGURE 6-19: Distribution of Direct Installation Program Funding of Completed Measures 6-37

ENERGY EFFICIENCY AND STRATEGIC R&D
FIGURE 6-20: Funding by Source 6-47
FIGURE 6-21: Breakdown of Strategic and Energy Efficiency R&D Projects 6-48

SECTION 7: CASE STUDIES

APPENDIX A: STANDARD PERFORMANCE CONTRACTING CASE STUDY

APPENDIX B: MARKET SECTOR ANALYSIS

FIGURE B-1: Electricity Consumption by Market Sector in New York State B-1
FIGURE B-2: Electricity Consumption of Select Household Appliances (as a Percent of Total Appliance Consumption) B-5
FIGURE B-3:Appliance Ownership Rates Among Low-Income Households of the Northeast B-9
FIGURE B-4: Annual Electric Expenditures for Low-Income Households in the Northeast by Electric End-Use B-10
FIGURE B-5: Economic Activity in New York State (by Percent of Total Annual Sales) B-13
FIGURE B-6: Commercial Electricity Use in Mid-Atlantic States by Major End-Use (Percentage of Total Consumption) B-16
FIGURE B-7: The Value of Manufacturing Shipments for New York's Industrial Sector, 1997 ..... B-20

APPENDIX C: PROGRAM PROCESS TRACKING